

Dunedin Town Hall Complex Redevelopment – Analysis of Key Options								
Option	Key Features	Functionality	Construction Risk	Heritage Impact	Project management issues	Consultation	Costs	Long Term Financial Viability
Regulatory work only		No improvement on the current situation.	Low	Negligible	Downtime of some areas of the complex for varying periods as the work is done. Some complete closure would be required.	No real issues	\$22m	Not viable in the short or long term.
Option 13	Manages the redevelopment within the existing building envelope. Major rebuild of the Glenroy Auditorium and new/enlarged basements under Town Hall and Dunedin Centre. Makes use of the ground and first floors of the Municipal Chambers. The Fullwood Room remains intact. New lift provides wheelchair and disabled access to the Windle and Linden rooms. Includes a new extension onto the Moray Place façade.	Provides much improved conference facilities up to 350 delegates. Limited improvement for the Town Hall as the basement foyer/crush space is remote. Shand Shelton recommends an improved loading dock on Harrop Street that would enable repositioning of the stage hoist and include both lift and stairs between new foyer and stalls levels.	High due to excavation of basement areas. Structural work would be required to ensure there was no reduction in the earthquake strength of the buildings.	Leaves the building's exterior largely unaltered. Eliminates the need for new openings to the west elevation. Disadvantage is the insertion of a new stairwell in the void between Municipal Chambers and Town Hall. The creation of this space was expressly stipulated by the competition guidelines for the original Town Hall. Also loses heritage features of Town Hall basement and the alteration of the only two surviving openings in the ground floor foyer of the Town Hall.	Estimate of the overall construction period for Option 13 is 24 months. The Town Hall is likely to be closed down for 12 to 14 months and the Dunedin Centre will need to be closed for about 11 months during basement construction. Other issues include relocation of the present functions of the Municipal Chambers. The Metro Cinema, City Property and Hungry Frenchman all have to be relocated.	Preserves the western façade of the Town Hall and the space between the Town Hall and St Paul's Cathedral. Therefore largely mitigates the public's concerns. Conference organisers are also supportive of the proposal to develop space in the Municipal Chambers.	\$48m	This is a positive Option in terms of future operating cash flows.

Dunedin Town Hall Complex Redevelopment – Analysis of Key Options

Option	Key Features	Functionality	Construction Risk	Heritage Impact	Project management issues	Consultation	Costs	Long Term Financial Viability
Option 14	<p>Includes an atrium on Harrop Street, within the current planning designation. This would extend the Town Hall foyer/crush space and also provide improved wayfinding to the Fullwood Room conference facilities in the Dunedin Centre building. The Glenroy auditorium remains unaltered, and there is no extension into the Municipal Chambers building. Includes construction of new town hall entry on Moray Place. The Atrium would include a new entrance to the Dunedin Centre (wind lobby). All extensions are linked together and form a continuous wrap-around to the north and west elevations. A general upgrade of the Glenroy auditorium is not included in this scheme.</p>	<p>Shand Shelton believes Option 14 provides the preferred front-of-house environment for performance events in the Town Hall. It will also accommodate food and beverage sales outlets and will improve wayfinding to conference facilities. However, it provides limited improvements to the conference facilities. The layout also presents problems servicing through the foyer and there are potential difficulties running separate, concurrent events.</p> <p>A new B-train loading dock through the Metro Cinema is recommended.</p>	<p>There are no structural issues with Option 14.</p>	<p>Largely based around a major extension to the Harrop Street façade. While care has been taken to modify existing openings rather than creating new ones the extension is large in scale and, taken together with the northwest linking section and the Dunedin Centre wind lobby forms a 'wraparound' element running right around two elevations of the building. As such it tends to overwhelm the existing architecture. The proposed extension appears to dominate the original building and the strong corner tower element to the northwest is compromised.</p> <p>Once more, as noted above, the alteration of the only two surviving openings in the ground floor foyer.</p>	<p>Construction period of 20 months. The Atrium would be constructed first, which when completed would provide access to the building and allow Town Hall to remain in use. Moray Place entry to follow with Town Hall to be completed after 18 months.</p> <p>Other refurbishment work should be able to be completed around (reduced) bookings of the Town hall.</p> <p>Dunedin Centre refurbishment would be done last. It should be possible to keep the Dunedin Centre functioning while the work is being completed with maybe a small closedown while the front entry is constructed.</p>	<p>The outcome of both the public meetings and the focus groups was clear opposition to any changes to either the western façade of the Town Hall or Harrop Street.</p> <p>Resistance to an atrium on Harrop Street is strong and active and will be an ongoing issue for the project if this Option is pursued.</p> <p>No major improvement in conference facilities in the Dunedin Centre is also not likely to find favour with conference organisers.</p>	<p>\$46m</p>	<p>Much less positive economic impact than either Option 13 or the Alternative Option.</p>

Dunedin Town Hall Complex Redevelopment – Analysis of Key Options

Option	Key Features	Functionality	Construction Risk	Heritage Impact	Project management issues	Consultation	Costs	Long Term Financial Viability
Alternative Option with Atrium	<p>This Option includes an atrium on Harrop Street within the existing designation, a rebuild of the Glenroy auditorium and extension into the ground and first floors of the Municipal Chambers. Planning for this Option has been structured so that it could potentially be done in stages, with the Atrium deferred to a later date – see next Option. Key features also include a new Town Hall entry on Moray Place, which is needed mainly to provide front entrance disabled access to the Town Hall. The transformation of the Glenroy auditorium will see it become a truly multi-use space primarily tuned for orchestral music, but equally suitable for conferences up to 350 delegates. The second floor Fullwood room remains intact, albeit with a slight reduction in capacity to 200+ people, with adjacent foyer being extended for an equal capacity.</p>	<p>Shand Shelton states that this Alternative Option would provide the preferred Town Hall front-of-house environment. It would also provide the preferred conference facilities, including integration with the Town Hall for large conferences.</p> <p>The reconfiguration of the public stairs and lifts between the two buildings improve the general flow and wayfinding through the complex.</p> <p>Event load-in across the new Atrium is not ideal. A B-train loading dock through the area occupied by the Metro Cinema may need to be considered at a later date. Shand Shelton notes that the increased business resulting from improved facilities will exacerbate any servicing compromises.</p>	<p>There are no structural issues with this Option.</p>	<p>The main advantages of this Option over Option 13 are the reduced impact on the basement area and the retention of the void/ light well by the Municipal Chambers, according to Jackie Gillies. Compared to Option 14, this Option involves separate extensions rather than an overwhelming 'wrap around' element and, as a result, respects the existing built heritage to a greater extent.</p> <p>Other benefits are that the two remaining windows in the Town Hall foyer are retained, as is the original Town Hall circulation/ layout.</p>	<p>This Option will involve a 20 month construction period, with a staged Atrium construction lessening the impact on Town Hall operations. Short periods of closure would be required for all buildings, and the existing tenants in the Municipal Chambers would need to be permanently relocated.</p>	<p>The proposed changes to the Glenroy Auditorium and Municipal Chambers are likely to be acceptable to the public. However, the inclusion of an Atrium on Harrop Street will not be acceptable.</p> <p>The changes to the Glenroy Auditorium and the Fullwood Room as well as the addition of the new spaces in the Municipal Chambers building will be well received by the conference organisers.</p>	<p>\$50m</p>	<p>Strongest return to the city applies to this Option, with or without the Atrium.</p>

Dunedin Town Hall Complex Redevelopment – Analysis of Key Options

Option	Key Features	Functionality	Construction Risk	Heritage Impact	Project management issues	Consultation	Costs	Long Term Financial Viability
Alternative Option without Atrium	<p>The planning for the Alternative Option has been structured so that a staged development is possible, allowing a decision on the Atrium to be deferred. Under this scenario work could proceed on the rebuild of the Glenroy Auditorium, extension into the Municipal Chambers, new Town Hall entry on Moray Place, and new wind lobby entrance to the Dunedin Centre on Harrop Street without impacting on the functionality of an Atrium if it was built at a future date.</p> <p>It has the disadvantage of reducing the amount of additional foyer/crush space for the Town Hall, and reducing the possible way finding improvements.</p>	Largely as for Option 13 without the benefit of the basement crush space for large events at the Town Hall or large conferences. Retains load in through Harrop Street and the same improvements are recommended as per Option 13.	There are no structural issues with this Option.	As for the above Option without the impacts associated with the Harrop Street Atrium.	Not yet determined but likely to be the same or slightly less than the Option with the Atrium. There is still extensive work within the complex which will require a shutdown of the Dunedin Centre complex. And the existing tenants in the Municipal Chambers would need to be permanently relocated.	The advantages of this approach is that it answers the public's concerns around the Harrop Street façade and precinct, still provides premiere 'heritage' conference facilities for up to 350 delegates, and would keep costs under the budgeted level of \$45.4m.		Atrium makes no real difference to the viability so the same as the above.