## In the Environment Court at Christchurch

In the Matter of the Resource Management Act

1991

And

In the Matter of an appeal under Clause 14(1),

Schedule 1 of the Act

TE RŪNANGA O NGĀI TAHU **Between** 

**Appellant** 

**DUNEDIN CITY COUNCIL** And

Respondent

Notice of Appeal by Te Rūnanga o Ngāi Tahu on a decision on the Proposed Second Generation Dunedin City District

> Dated: 19 December 2018

Lane Neave Level 1, 2 Memorial Street PO Box 701 Queenstown 9348 Solicitor Acting: Joshua Leckie Email: joshua.leckie@laneneave.co.nz

Phone: 03 372 6307

lane neave.

To: The Registrar Environment Court Christchurch

## **Notice of Appeal**

- Te Rūnanga o Ngāi Tahu (Te Rūnanga) appeals against parts of decisions of the Dunedin City Council (Respondent) on the Proposed Second Generation Dunedin City District Plan (Proposed Plan).
- 2. Te Rūnanga made a submission on the Proposed Plan.
- 3. Te Rūnanga is not a trade competitor for the purposes of section 308D of the Resource Management Act 1991 (**Act**).
- 4. Te Rūnanga received notice of the Respondent's decisions on 7 November 2018.
- 5. The parts of the decisions that Te Rūnanga are appealing is (referred to collectively as **Decisions**):
  - (a) Rural Zones Decision Report; and
  - (b) Manawhenua Decision Report.

## **Reasons for the Appeal**

#### Particular Reasons

- Huriawa and Māpoutahi were two tribal properties vested fee-simple in Ngāi
   Tahu under the Ngāi Tahu Claims Settlement Act 1998.
- 7. These properties are of great importance to Ngāi Tahu Whānui and ensuring these properties are managed so that the cultural, archaeological, landscape and geological values are maintained is of the upmost importance to Ngāi Tahu.
- 8. Te Rūnanga and Kāti Huirapa Rūnaka ki Puketeraki are working with the Department of Conservation to prepare and implement management plans (Management Plans) for Huriawa and Māpoutahi. These will set out lwi andPapatipu Rūnaka aspirations to carry out land use activities on Huriawa

- and Māpoutahi in the future (for example, signs, interpretation, structures, fences and tracks).
- 9. While a number of activities can be undertaken as permitted activities on Huriawa and Māpoutahi, the Decisions require resource consent for some land use activities on Huriawa and Māpoutahi, such as earthworks, signage, buildings and structures.
- 10. It is considered the consent requirements under the Decisions are disproportionate to the type and scale of the activities Te Rūnanga would seek to undertake on the properties. The Decisions also create inefficiencies in effects assessment. It is considered the Decisions fail to recognise the environmental controls ensured by the requirement of a Management Plan to first be approved before an activity can take place.
- 11. A consenting trigger also adds to the existing regulatory regime requiring lwi and Rūnaka to obtain an authority under the Heritage New Zealand Pouhere Taonga Act 2014 for any activity that affects an archaeological site.
- 12. There is inadequate effects based justification for Iwi and Rūnaka to also have to obtain an additional resource consent under the District Plan for land use activities on these properties, where such activities are carried out in accordance with a Management Plan.
- 13. Te Rūnanga seek that the Proposed Plan enables and facilitates land use activities on Huriawa and Māpoutahi that comply with a Management Plan without the need for a resource consent.
- 14. Alternatively, Te Rūnanga seek that specific activities should be identified in the Proposed Plan as being permitted on Huriawa and Māpoutahi to provide certainty to both Te Rūnanga and the Respondent as to what activities and effects can occur on those areas without the need to obtain a resource consent.

## General Reasons

15. The general reasons for Te Rūnanga's appeal are that the Decisions on the Proposed Plan fail to appropriately enable minor and anticipated land use activities on Huriawa and Māpoutahi and create inefficiencies in environmental controls. As such, the Decisions:

- do not adequately recognise or provide for the relationship of Ngāi
   Tahu with Huriawa and Māpoutahi and its role in the management of
   the tribal properties;
- (b) impose undue constraints and complexity on the use and maintenance of Huriawa and Māpoutahi for non-commercial activities;
- (c) fail to achieve the functions of the Respondent under section 31 of the Act in respect of the integrated management of the effects of the use and development of land and physical resources;
- (d) fail to meet the requirements of section 32;
- does not recognise and provide for the relationship of Māori and their culture and traditions with their ancestral lands, water, sites, waahi tapu, and other taonga under section 6(e);
- (f) does not recognise and provide for the protection of protected customary rights under section 6(g);
- (g) do not represent an efficient use of land under section 7(a);
- (h) fail to take into account the principles of Te Tiriti o Waitangi;
- does not enable Ngāi Tahu people and communities to provide for their social economic and cultural wellbeing and for their health and safety; and
- (j) fail to promote sustainable management of resources and will not achieve the purpose of the Act.

## **Relief Sought**

16. Te Rūnanga seek the following relief subject to the general relief in paragraphs 16(c) to 8(d) below (noting the provisions referred to are those as shown in the Decisions Version of the Proposed Plan):

## **Primary Relief**

(a) As the primary form of relief make the following amendments to the Proposed Plan:

Section 1: Plan Overview and Introduction

(i) Amend Section 1: Plan Overview and Introduction to add the following new definitions to 1.4.1 Definitions:

"Huriawa means the land described by that name in Section 142 of the Ngāi Tahu Claims Settlement Act 1998."

"Māpoutahi means the land described by that name in Section 143 of the Ngāi Tahu Claims Settlement Act 1998."

"An Approved Management Plan means a management plan approved by Te Rūnanga o Ngāi Tahu [whether alone or jointly with another party]."

## Section 13: Heritage

(ii) Amend Section 13: Heritage to add the following new policy to 13.2 Objectives and Policies:

"Enable land use activities on Huriawa and Māpoutahi that comply with an Approved Management Plan."

(iii) Amend Section 13: Heritage to add the following new rule/performance standard into Rules 13.3 to 13.9:

"Except that activities on Huriawa and Māpoutahi that comply with an Approved Management Plan, which shall be a permitted activity."

## Section 14: Manawhenua Chapter

(iv) Amend Section 14: Manawhenua to add the following new policy under 14.2 Objectives and Policies:

"Enable land use activities on Huriawa and Māpoutahi that comply with an Approved Management Plan."

(v) Amend Section 14: Manawhenua to add the following new rule/performance standard into Rules 14.3 to 14.7:

"Except that activities on Huriawa and Māpoutahi that comply with an Approved Management Plan, which shall be a permitted activity."

## Section 16: Rural Zones

(vi) Amend Section 16: Rural Zones to add the following new policy under 16.2 Objectives and Policies:

"Enable land use activities on Huriawa and Māpoutahi that comply with an Approved Management Plan."

(vii) Amend Section 16: Rural Zones to add the following new rule/performance standard into Rules 16.3 to 16.13:

"Except that activities on Huriawa and Māpoutahi that comply with an Approved Management Plan, which shall be a permitted activity."

## **Appendices**

(viii) Amend Appendix A4.6.1 as follows:

"Part of the Huriawa Peninsula was vested fee-simple in Te Rūnanga o Ngāi Tahu under the Ngāi Tahu Claims Settlement Act 1998; Te Rūnanga o Ngāi Tahu and Kāti Huirapa Rūnaka ki Puketeraki are working with the Department of Conservation to prepare a management plan for this area. Land use activities on Huriawa should be carried out in accordance with an Approved Management Plan."

(ix) Amend Appendix A4.17.1 as follows:

"Māpoutahi peninsula was vested fee-simple in Te Rūnanga o Ngāi Tahu under the Ngāi Tahu Claims Settlement Act 1998; Te Rūnanga o Ngāi Tahu, Kāti Huirapa Rūnaka ki Puketeraki and the Department of Conservation are working with the Department of Conservation to prepare a management plan for this area. Land use activities on Māpoutahi should be carried out in accordance with an Approved Management Plan."

## **Alternative Relief**

- (b) An alternative and lesser preferred relief to the primary relief above, is to amend the Proposed Plan as follows:
  - (i) Amend Section 13: Heritage, Section 14: Manawhenua and Section 16: Rural Zones to add new rules or performance

standards to provide for specific activities as permitted activities on Huriawa and Māpoutahi with express permitted activity standards.

## **General Relief**

- (c) That the Proposed Plan be amended in a similar or such other way as may be appropriate to address the matters raised in this appeal; and
- (d) Any other similar, consequential, alternative, or other relief as is necessary to address the issues raised in this appeal or otherwise raised in Te Rūnanga's submission and further submission.

## **Attached Documents**

- 17. The following documents are **attached** to this notice:
  - (a) a copy of Te Rūnanga o Ngāi Tahu's submission (**Annexure A**);
  - (b) the relevant parts of the Respondent's decisions (Annexure B); and
  - (c) a list of the names and addresses of the persons to be served with a copy of this notice of appeal (**Annexure C**).

Dated this 19<sup>th</sup> day of December 2018

Joshua Leckie

Counsel for Te Rūnanga o Ngāi Tahu

## Address for Service for the Appellant:

Lane Neave Level 1 2 Memorial Street Queenstown 9300 Phone: 03 372 6307

Email: joshua.leckie@laneneave.co.nz

Contact person: Joshua Leckie

## Advice to Recipients of Copy of Notice of Appeal

## How to become a Party to Proceedings

You may be a party to the appeal if:

Within 15 working days after the period for lodging a notice of appeal ends, lodge a notice of your wish to be a party to the proceedings (in form 33) with the Environment Court and serve copies of your notice on the relevant local authority and the appellant; and

Within 20 working days after the period for lodging a notice of appeal ends, serve copies of your notice on all other parties in accordance with the requirements below.

Your right to be a party to the proceedings in the court may be limited by the trade competition provisions in section 274(1)and Part 11A of the Resource Management Act 1991.

You may apply to the Environment Court under section 281 of the Resource Management Act 1991 for a waiver of the above timing or service requirements (see form 38).

## Service Requirements in Accordance with ENV-2018-CHC-206

Section 274 notices must be lodged with the court electronically by email to Christine.McKee@justive.govt.nz in accordance with the standard requirements set out in the Resource Management Act 1991 and the Resource Management (Forms, Fees, and Procedure) Regulations 2003.

The requirement relating to the service of section 274 notices have been altered to the effect that:

- Section 274 notices must be served on the Council electronically by email to dppappeals@qldc.govt.nz and on the appellant to any email address provided in the notice of appeal;
- The requirement to lodge a signed original and one hard copy of any section 274 notices with the Court has been waived:
- The requirement for section 274 parties to serve their notice/form 33 on all other parties has been waived; and

Service of section 274 notices on "all other parties" will be deemed to be
effected to the Council uploading copies of section 274 notices onto its
website as soon as possible (within two working days) after the section
274 notice is received..

## ANNEXURE A – Copy of Te Rūnanga o Ngāi Tahu's Submission

## Submission on Proposed Second Generation Dunedin City District Plan under Clause 6 of the First Schedule of the Resource Management Act 1991

To: Dunedin City Council, PO Box 5045, Moray Place, Dunedin 9058

**Submitter:** Te R□nanga o Ng□i Tahu, PO Box 13-046, Christchurch 8024

- 1. Te R□nanga o Ng□i Tahu could not gain an advantage in trade competition through this submission.
- 2. The submission of Te R□nanga o Ng□i Tahu seeks to:
  - (a) ensure that the Proposed District Plan is consistent with promoting the sustainable management purpose of the Resource Management Act 1991 (RMA);
  - (b) ensure consistency with Part 2 and other relevant provisions of the RMA;
  - (c) enable Ng□i Tahu people and communities to provide for their social, economic and cultural wellbeing and for their health and safety;
  - (d) promote the efficient use and development of natural and physical resources; and
  - (e) promote sound resource management practice.
- 3. Te R□nanga o Ng□i Tahu seeks the following decision from the Dunedin City Council:
  - (a) that the submissions and relief sought (or those with similar or like effect) outlined in this submission and below be accepted;
  - (b) such further or other relief as is appropriate or desirable in order to take account of the concerns and issues expressed in this submission; and
  - (c) that in the event that the submissions and relief sought set out above are not implemented, the Proposed District Plan be withdrawn.
- 4. Te R□nanga o Ng□i Tahu wishes to be heard in support of this submission.
- 5. If others make a similar submission, Te R□nanga o Ng□i Tahu would be prepared to consider presenting a joint case with them at any hearing.

Signature \_\_\_\_\_\_\_Aaron Leith, on behalf of Te R□nanga o Ng□i Tahu

Date: 24 November 2015

Address for service: Te R□nanga o Ng□i Tahu, PO Box 13-046, Christchurch 8024. Attention: Kelly Governor / Aaron Leith Telephone: (03) 366 4344

E-mail: info@ngaitahu.iwi.nz

Sub. No.	Plan Section	The specific Plan provision/s that my submission relates to are:	My submission is that:	I seek the following decisions from the Dunedin City Council:
1.	1 Plan Overview and Introduction	1.5.1 Activity Definitions	Definitions of Huriawa, M□poutahi and Approved Management Plan should be included in the District Plan, in order to provide clarification and certainty to Council and Plan users.	That new definitions be inserted into 1.5.1 Activity Definitions, as follows:  • Huriawa means the land described by that name in Section 142 of the Ng□i Tahu Claims Settlement Act 1998. • M□poutahi means the land described by that name in Section 143 of the Ng□i Tahu Claims Settlement Act 1998. • An Approved Management Plan means a management plan approved by Te R□nanga o Ng□i Tahu [whether alone or jointly with another party].
2.	13 Heritage	13.2 Objectives and Policies Rules 13.3 to 13.9	The planning maps of the proposed District Plan identify Huriawa as being subject to archaeological site A001 [Huriawa P□ I43/1] and the archaeological alert layer. M□poutahi is identified as being subject to archaeological site A004 [M□poutahi P□ 144/17].	That a new policy be inserted into 13.2 as follows:  • Enable land use activities on Huriawa and M□poutahi that comply with an Approved Management Plan.

Sub. No.	Plan Section	The specific Plan provision/s that my submission relates to are:	My submission is that:	I seek the following decisions from the Dunedin City Council:
			The proposed District Plan provisions appear to require resource consent for land use activities on Huriawa and M□poutahi, such as earthworks buildings and structures.  Huriawa and M□poutahi were vested fee-simple in Te R□nanga o Ng□i Tahu under the Ng□i Tahu Claims Settlement Act 1998.  Te R□nanga o Ng□i Tahu and K□ti Huirapa R□naka ki Puketeraki are working with the Department of Conservation to prepare management plans for Huriawa and M□poutahi. These will set out Iwi and papatipu r□naka aspirations to carry out land use activities on Huriawa and M□poutahi in the future [for example, signs, interpretation, structures, fences and tracks].  There is already a need for Iwi and R□naka to obtain an authority under the Heritage New Zealand Pouhere Taonga Act 2014 for any activity that affects an archaeological site.  It is inappropriate for Iwi and R□naka to also have to obtain an additional resource consent from Council for land use activities on these properties, where such activities are carried out in accordance with an Approved Management Plan.	That a new rule / performance standard be inserted into Rules 13.3 to 13.9, as follows:  • Except that activities on Huriawa and M□poutahi that comply with an Approved Management Plan, which shall be a permitted activity.
			The District Plan should enable and facilitate land	

Sub. No.	Plan Section	The specific Plan provision/s that my submission relates to are:	My submission is that:	I seek the following decisions from the Dunedin City Council:
3.	14 Manawhenua	14.2 Objectives and Policies Rules 14.3 to 14.7	use activities on Huriawa and M□poutahi that comply with an Approved Management Plan without the need for a resource consent.  The planning maps of the proposed District Plan identify Huriawa and M□poutahi as being subject to W□hi Tupuna sites.  The proposed District Plan provisions appear to require resource consent for land use activities on Huriawa and M□poutahi, such as earthworks buildings and structures.  Huriawa and M□poutahi were vested fee-simple in Te R□nanga o Ng□i Tahu under the Ng□i Tahu Claims Settlement Act 1998.  Te R□nanga o Ng□i Tahu and K□ti Huirapa R□naka ki Puketeraki are working with the Department of Conservation to prepare management plans for Huriawa and M□poutahi. These will set out lwi and papatipu r□naka aspirations to carry out land use activities on Huriawa and M□poutahi in the future [for example, signs, interpretation, structures, fences and tracks].  There is already a need for lwi and R□naka to obtain an authority under the Heritage New Zealand Pouhere Taonga Act 2014 for any activity that affects an archaeological site.	That a new policy be inserted into 14.2 as follows:  • Enable land use activities on Huriawa and M□poutahi that comply with an Approved Management Plan.  That a new rule / performance standard be inserted into Rules 14.3 to 14.7, as follows:  • Except that activities on Huriawa and M□poutahi that comply with an Approved Management Plan, which shall be a permitted activity.

Sub. No.	Plan Section	The specific Plan provision/s that my submission relates to are:	My submission is that:	I seek the following decisions from the Dunedin City Council:
			It is inappropriate for Iwi and R□naka to also have to obtain an additional resource consent from Council for land use activities on these properties, where such activities are carried out in accordance with an Approved Management Plan.  The District Plan should enable and facilitate land use activities on Huriawa and M□poutahi that comply with an Approved Management Plan without the need for a resource consent.	
4.	16 Rural Zones	16.2 Objectives and Policies Rules 16.3 to 16.13	The planning maps of the proposed District Plan identify Huriawa and M□poutahi as being zoned Rural Coastal, situated in the coastal environment and being subject to the ONF landscape overlay.  The proposed District Plan provisions appear to require resource consent for land use activities on Huriawa and M□poutahi, such as earthworks buildings and structures.  Huriawa and M□poutahi were vested fee-simple in Te R□nanga o Ng□i Tahu under the Ng□i Tahu Claims Settlement Act 1998.  Te R□nanga o Ng□i Tahu and K□ti Huirapa R□naka ki Puketeraki are working with the Department of Conservation to prepare management plans for Huriawa and M□poutahi. These will set out lwi and papatipu r□naka aspirations to carry out land use activities on Huriawa and M□poutahi in the future [for	Enable land use activities on Huriawa and M□poutahi that comply with an Approved Management Plan.  That a new rule / performance standard be inserted into Rules 16.3 to 16.13, as follows:      Except that activities on Huriawa and M□poutahi that comply with an Approved Management Plan, which shall

Sub. No.	Plan Section	The specific Plan provision/s that my submission relates to are:	My submission is that:	I seek the following decisions from the Dunedin City Council:
5.	F Appendices	A4. Wāhi Tūpuna Values [A4.6 Huriawa Peninsula]	example, signs, interpretation, structures, fences and tracks].  There is already a need for lwi and R naka to obtain an authority under the Heritage New Zealand Pouhere Taonga Act 2014 for any activity that affects an archaeological site.  It is inappropriate for lwi and R naka to also have to obtain an additional resource consent from Council for land use activities on these properties, where such activities are carried out in accordance with an Approved Management Plan.  The District Plan should enable and facilitate land use activities on Huriawa and M poutahi that comply with an Approved Management Plan without the need for a resource consent.  The District Plan should identify both the ownership and management work being carried out on Huriawa. It should also reflect that Te R nanga o Ng Tahu and K ti Huirapa R naka ki Puketeraki are working with the Department of Conservation to prepare a management plan for this property. It is also important to signal that land use activities should be carried out in accordance with an Approved Management Plan.	That A4.6.1 be amended by inserting the following wording:  • Huriawa was vested fee-simple in Te R□nanga o Ng□i Tahu under the Ng□i Tahu Claims Settlement Act 1998.  • Te R□nanga o Ng□i Tahu and K□ti Huirapa R□naka ki Puketeraki are working with the Department of Conservation to prepare a management plan for Huriawa.
				Land use activities on Huriawa

Sub. No.	Plan Section	The specific Plan provision/s that my submission relates to are:	My submission is that:	I seek the following decisions from the Dunedin City Council:
				should be carried out in accordance with an Approved Management Plan.
6.	F Appendices	A4. Wāhi Tūpuna Values [A4.17 Mapoutahi and Mateawhiawhi – Beach at Purakaunui Bay]	The District Plan should identify the ownership of M□poutahi. It should also reflect that Te R□nanga o Ng□i Tahu, K□ti Huirapa R□naka ki Puketeraki and the Department of Conservation are responsible for managing Māpoutahi. It is appropriate to signal that land use activities should be carried out in accordance with an Approved Management Plan.	That A4.17.1 be amended by inserting the following wording:  • Māpoutahi was vested feesimple in Te Rūnanga o Ngāi Tahu under the Ngāi Tahu Claims Settlement Act 1998.  • Te Rūnanga o Ngāi Tahu, Kāti Huirapa Rūnaka ki Puketeraki and the Department of Conservation are responsible for managing Māpoutahi.  • Land use activities on Māpoutahi should be carried out in accordance with an Approved Management Plan.

## **ANNEXURES B – Copies of the Relevant Parts of the Decisions**



# Rural Zones Hearing Decision of Hearings Panel

Proposed Second Generation Dunedin City District Plan (2GP)

7 November 2018

territorial local authorities under a triennial agreement, but could not produce formal confirmation of this delegation. We recommended clarification of this position between the two authorities as a matter of relative urgency, to then enable the resource management issues listed under s30(c) to be considered and the appropriateness of any relevant management options formally assessed.

1073. The Reporting Officer made no change to his recommendation in relation to *Forest* and *Bird* and *Otago Regional Council's* submissions to add new provisions to manage land use in dry catchments.

#### 3.7.3.5 Decision and reasons

- 1074. We reject the submission of *HPPC* (OS447.71) and *STOP* (OS900.103) to change the word 'minor' to 'insignificant' and to change the word 'insignificant' to 'very insignificant, meaning bordering on unidentifiable'. With regard to the use of the word 'minor', we draw attention to our decision in the Natural Environment report on a similar submission by *HPPC* (OS447.15). We note the concerns of the further submitters and agree with the assessment of the Reporting Officer that it would not be appropriate to use the requested terminology as it would be inconsistent with the 2GP drafting protocol, as detailed in the Plan Overview Section 42A Report (pages 22-23) and we therefore reject both submissions.
- 1075. We reject the submissions of Otago Regional Council (OS908.72) and Forest and Bird NZ (OS958.110) that the 2GP should be managing land conversions in dry catchments. We agree with the reasoning by the Reporting Officer and note, as discussed elsewhere, the control of land use for the maintenance and enhancement of water and ecosystems in water bodies and coastal water is a responsibility of regional councils under s30(c) of the RMA.

## 3.7.4 Request for new provisions for Huriawa and Māpoutahi

## 3.7.4.1 Background

- 1076. Huriawa Peninsula has several pā sites and is mapped in the 2GP as a wāhi tūpuna. The bulk of the peninsula, with the address of 50 Sulisker Street Karitane, is a former historic reserve, now vested in Te Rūnanga o Ngāi Tahu under the Ngāi Tahu Claims Settlement Act 1998 and is also mapped as the Karitane Outstanding Natural Feature overlay and the Karitane Headland Coastal Environment, with the general zoning of Coastal Rural Zone.
- 1077. Māpoutahi (peninsula) and Mateawheawhe (beach) located at the northwestern point of Pūrākaunui Bay are mapped in the 2GP as wāhi tūpuna and identified as Māpoutahi Pā archaeological site (Heritage NZ category 2). The peninsula is also mapped as the Māpoutahi Outstanding Natural Feature, while the beach and the landward edge of the site are mapped as part of the Hayward Coast Significant Natural Landscape. The entire area is also mapped as Māpoutahi Cliffs Coastal Environment and has a general zoning of Coastal Rural Zone.

## 3.7.4.2 Submissions

1078. Te Rūnanga o Ngāi Tahu (OS790.2, 3 & 4) sought to add new policies, rules and related definitions to enable land use activities on Huriawa and Māpoutahi, noting that there is already a need to obtain an Archaeological Authority from Heritage New Zealand for any activity (such as earthworks or buildings) that affects an archaeological site. Te Rūnanga o Ngāi Tahu considered that the 2GP should enable and facilitate land use activities on Huriawa and Māpoutahi that comply with an Approved Management Plan, without the need for a resource consent. The submission stated that both Te Rūnanga o Ngāi Tahu and Kāti Huirapa Rūnaka ki Puketeraki are working with DoC to prepare management plans for Huriawa and Māpoutahi setting out iwi and papatipu aspirations for land use activities in the future. The submission provided the example of signs, interpretations, structures, fences and tracks as

- potential activities. *Kāti Huirapa Rūnaka ki Puketeraki* and *Te Rūnanga o Otakou* (FS2456.14 & 76) supported OS790.3 and OS790.4 respectively because they are 'consistent with the aspirations' of the Rūnanga.
- 1079. *Te Rūnanga o Ngāi Tahu* (OS790.13) also sought that if the relief sought by the submissions described above was not implemented, the submitter wished the whole plan to be withdrawn.
- 1080. A related submission point, to amend the wāhi tūpuna values listed in the appendices for both Huriawa and Māpoutahi, was considered in the Manawhenua Section 42A report (OS790.5 and OS790.6). That report recommended accepting the submission in part and adding additional information with regard to the areas vested to Ngāi Tahu. However, the Report recommended against adding in reference to a requirement that activities in the areas be carried out "in accordance with an approved management plan" as this is not a DCC enforcement matter. In addition, the report recommended declining amending the mapping so that the wāhi tūpuna mapped areas are consistent with the legal description of the vested areas. The Reporting Officer noted that the areas identified in *Te Rūnanga o Ngāi Tahu's* submission were smaller than the wāhi tūpuna mapped areas, which were mapped by Manawhenua and which reflected the areas which are significant to them.

## 3.7.4.3 Section 42A Report

- 1081. With regard to the request by *Te Rūnanga o Ngāi Tahu*, the Reporting Officer, Katie James, did not consider it to be appropriate to permit all activities that comply with a management plan approved by Ngāi Tahu, or to provide a new definition of 'approved management plan' within the 2GP. She explained that:
  - a management plan is prepared for different purposes than a district plan and may have different standards for activities than those set out in the 2GP, and would not be enforceable by the DCC.
  - the DCC has a statutory role under s31 of the Resource Management Act 1991
    to control any actual or potential effects of the use, development, or
    protection of land within its jurisdiction, including reserve land, and it is
    important that activities with potential material effects on the values of
    Huriawa and Māpoutahi are appropriately managed.
  - the recognition of both Huriawa and Māpoutahi as Outstanding Natural Features means that there is more restriction on effects for development activities taking place at these sites. The Reporting Officer considered that this was appropriate given the rich cultural, archaeological, landscape and geological values associated with both landforms.
  - Objective 10.2.5 of the 2GP provides for the protection of ONFs along with Significant Natural Landscapes and Outstanding Natural Landscapes from inappropriate development. Policy 10.2.5.1 limits rural and community activities (including conservation) in an ONF to those that do not require buildings or involve change to the landform. Policy 10.2.5.4 expressly avoids buildings and structures in an ONF unless there are no material effects on landscape values.
- 1082. With regard to the concern raised by the submitter that activities such as earthworks would potentially require resource consent as well as an Archaeological Authority, the Reporting Officer considered that this was appropriate, where necessary, as the two types of consent serve different purposes. An Archaeological Authority may be required for any work affecting an archaeological site because of the high risks associated with disturbance of archaeological remains or artefacts.
- 1083. The Reporting Officer noted that the 2GP allows for small scale earthworks without resource consent, although the status of Huriawa and Māpoutahi as Outstanding Natural Features places more restrictions on earthworks given the potentially greater adverse effects on these visually prominent natural features. In addition, she noted that earthworks are considered to be one of the principal threats to wāhi tūpuna values. She noted further, that in an ONF, any tracks involving a greater than 1m

change in ground level or involving more than  $50 \, \text{m}^2$  in area will require resource consent, allowing for minimal disturbance of the land, such as maintenance of an existing track. However, the Reporting Officer also noted that:

- fences are a permitted activity and while any new building or structure is noncomplying, other buildings and structures activities such as repairs and maintenance are restricted discretionary.
- The 2GP allows for one ancillary sign per site while public amenities including information or interpretation kiosks or panels, place name signs, picnic tables, seating and pedestrian paths are permitted, subject to size, setbacks and status of any associated development activities.
- 1084. Therefore, the Reporting Officer was satisfied that the 2GP provided for a range of activities that are appropriate for the nature of the two areas while ensuring that activities associated with material effects on landscape values, such as large scale earthworks, buildings and structures, are subject to a resource consent process. In relation to the areas defined as Huriawa and Māpoutahi, she did not consider it to be appropriate to provide definitions for both Huriawa and Māpoutahi based on the description contained within the Ngāi Tahu Settlement Claims Act because these describe smaller areas than the wāhi tūpuna mapped areas in the 2GP, which were mapped by Manawhenua, and which reflected the larger areas which are significant to them rather than being based on legal ownership.
- 1085. The s42A Report recommended rejecting the submission to withdraw the whole plan if other submission points were not implemented.

## 3.7.4.4 Hearing

The written evidence noted that an approved management plan approach has been applied successfully in Southland District. The submitter's evidence suggested that a Management Plan would not necessarily be at cross purposes with the District Plan and it was not necessary for DCC to reject the management plan approach because the effects of activities within the management plan would be below the 'materiality threshold' to need controlling via consents and as the properties are non-commercial they would be managed "in a manner that respects their intrinsic landscape and cultural values". The submitter was concerned that if more than one sign was required it would require resource consent which would be "incongruous to the scale of effect and fails to recognise the safety checks provided by the requirement of a management plan to first be approved before an activity can take place" (Statement of Evidence, p. 5).

#### 3.7.4.5 Revised recommendations

1087. In her revised recommendations, the Reporting Officer referred to the s42A Report where she outlined a range of activities that would be permitted on the site under the 2GP, including: maintenance of an existing track involving less than 1m change in ground level or less than 50m2 in area, fences, and a range of public amenities subject to size, setbacks and status of associated development activities including: information or interpretation kiosks or panels, place name signs, picnic tables, seating and pedestrian paths. With respect to signs, she considered that the 2GP provides sufficient scope to allow Te Rūnanga to provide for a range of information or place name signs as appropriate under public amenities rules. She explained that consent would only be required if the height exceeded 3m and for place name signs, if the maximum area of the display face exceeded 2m2. In addition, she noted that one ancillary sign (sign related to permitted or lawfully established land use activity) is allowed in an ONF. While accepting that a management plan would not necessarily be at cross purposes with the plan and recognising the intent to manage the areas in a way that respects intrinsic landscape and cultural values, she considered that there is a level of uncertainty around what would be included in the Management Plan. In addition, as the Management Plan would not require approval by the DCC, she considered it appropriate that the 2GP provisions continued to apply to these areas. This would allow for a range of activities to be carried out without consent while still requiring that more significant activities would be subject to 2GP requirements.

#### 3.7.4.6 Decision and reasons

- 1088. We reject the submission of *Te Rūnanga o Ngāi Tahu* (OS790.2, 3 & 4) to add new policies, rules and related definitions to enable land use activities on Huriawa and Māpoutahi. We agree with the assessment of the Reporting Officer that the 2GP already provides for a range of activities (including many that are listed in *Te Rūnanga o Ngāi Tahu's* submission) that are appropriate for the special nature of each area while ensuring that activities which are associated with greater effects are managed through the resource consent process. We note the submitter's evidence that a management plan would not necessarily be at cross purposes with the District Plan, however the DCC would have no control or certainty as to the level of protection to be provided to Māpoutahi or Huriawa or what would be provided for as de facto permitted activities. Without such certainty, we cannot be sure that the effects of these activities would be minor, or that the DCC would be meeting its requirements under s31. We do not consider that the rules in the 2GP are unduly onerous given the importance of these two sites.
- 1089. We also reject the request of *Te Rūnanga o Ngāi Tahu* (OS790.13) to withdraw the 2GP if the relief sought in the submitter's other submissions is not implemented.

## 3.8 Zoning and mapping submissions

## 3.8.1 Introduction

1090. This section of the Decision Report responds to zoning and mapping submissions.

## 3.8.2 High class soils mapped area

## 3.8.2.1 Background

1091. The high class soils mapped area (HCS mapped area) in the 2GP was carried over from the Dunedin District Plan (2006). There was one submission in support of the HCS mapped area and several seeking removal at particular locations, discussed separately below.

## 3.8.2.2 Submission in support

1092. Vicky Carthew (OS342.3) sought to retain the HCS mapped area.

## 3.8.2.3 60 Mount Grand Rd

1093. James Fraser (OS93.3) sought to remove the mapped area from his property at 60 Mount Grand Rd. He did not consider that his land has high class soils based on his own review of information relating to characteristics of high class soils (see submission for full details). There is a small area of high class soils mapped at the centre of the site. The submitter stated that this is an elevated site and has a farm road cut through it. He also explained that the soil is too rocky and the site is too steep, noting that part of the HCS mapped areas is also in a Hazard 2 overlay zone, and attached photos to the submission as evidence. The submitter also provides a list of characteristics for high class soils, one of which is listed as slopes of less than 12°. The submitter also asked for more information about 'what is High Class Soil?'



# Manawhenua Decision of the Hearings Panel

Proposed Second Generation Dunedin City District Plan (2GP)

**7 November 2018** 

165. We are also concerned that while Nga Rūnanga's submission is clear and provides legal scope to extend the wāhi tūpuna to cover the whole of Otago Peninsula, Peninsula residents would not have been aware of this proposal. For reasons of natural justice, we consider it would be fairer to make such a major change through a variation to the 2GP. Consequently, we reject the request of Ngā Rūnanga (OS1071.122) to extend the wāhi tūpuna site to incorporate the whole of Otago Peninsula through this process.

## 3.9.3 Appendix A4 Wāhi Tūpuna values

## 3.9.3.1 Appendix A4.6 Huriawa Peninsula

166. Te Rūnanga o Ngāi Tahu (TRoNT) (OS790.5), supported by Ngā Rūnanga (FS2456.16), requested additional information be added to the description of wāhi tūpuna site A4.6 (Huriawa), and to state that management of activities on Huriawa must be undertaken in accordance with an approved management plan. The wording proposed was:

"Huriawa was vested fee-simple in Te Rūnanga o Ngāi Tahu under the Ngāi Tahu Claims Settlement Act 1998. Te Rūnanga o Ngāi Tahu and Kāti Huirapa Rūnaka ki Puketeraki are working with the Department of Conservation to prepare a management plan for Huriawa. Land use activities on Huriawa should be carried out in accordance with an Approved Management Plan".

- 167. By way of background, *TRoNT* (OS790.4) also sought changes to the activity status of activities on Huriawa such that activities are permitted if they are carried out in accordance with a management plan. Related submission point OS790.3 was to include a definition of 'Huriawa' that matches the description of the land vested in Te Rūnanga o Ngāi Tahu under the Ngāi Tahu Claims Settlement Act. These submissions were considered in the Rural topic hearing. Our decision is to reject those submissions (see Rural decision report).
- 168. Ngā Rūnanga (OS1071.17, 18) also sought to ensure that mapping of the Huriawa wāhi tūpuna mapped area, and the related Huriawa height restriction mapped area (OS1071.18), were consistent with the legal description of these sites in the TRONT submission.
- 169. The Reporting Officer explained that the area identified as Huriawa in *TRoNT's* submission is a smaller area than the area mapped as a wāhi tūpuna in the 2GP, as only part of the area significant to manawhenua was vested to Ngāi Tahu. Consequently, she recommended that the wāhi tūpuna A4.6 remained as mapped in the 2GP (s42A Report, Section 4.3.22, pp. 54-55).
- 170. She also noted that the Huriawa height restriction mapped area does not overlap with the area identified by *TRoNT*, and consequently her view was that there was no need to amend the mapping of that area.
- 171. She recommended that the additional wording requested by *TRoNT* be added, but in an amended form as below, to reflect the fact that the Ngāi Tahu site and the wāhi tūpuna areas are different and that DCC cannot enforce any management plan for the area.

"Part of the Huriawa peninsula was vested fee simple in Te Rūnanga o Ngāi Tahu under the Ngāi Tahu Claims Settlement Act 1998; Te Rūnanga o Ngāi Tahu and Kāti Huirapa Rūnaka ki Puketeraki are working with the Department of Conservation to prepare a management plan for this area."

172. Mr Vial, representing Ngā Rūnanga, supported this approach in his written evidence.

## 3.9.3.1.1 Decision and decision reasons

173. We accept *TRoNT's* submissions in part, and the relief recommended by the Reporting Officer for the reasons outlined in the s42A Report as detailed above. The amendment to A4.6.1 Description of area is shown in Appendix 1 (MW 790.5). No changes are made to the A4.6 Huriawa Peninsula wāhi tūpuna area mapped or the Huriawa height restriction mapped area in response to these submissions.

- 3.9.3.2 Appendix A4.17 Mapoutahi and Mateawheawhe (Beach at Pūrākaunui Bay)
- 174. As with Huriawa, *TRoNT* (OS790.6), supported by *Ngā Rūnanga* (FS2456.17), sought to amend the description of wāhi tūpuna site A4.17 (Mapoutahi and Mateawheawhe) by inserting:

"Mapoutahi was vested fee-simple in Te Rūnanga o Ngai Tahu under the Ngai Tahu Claims Settlement Act 1998; Te Rūnanga o Ngai Tahu, Kāti Huirapa Rūnaka ki Puketeraki are working with the Department of Conservation to prepare a management plan for this area. Land use activities on Mapoutahi should be carried out in accordance with an Approved Management Plan".

- 175. *Ngā Rūnanga* (OS1071.137) sought that mapping of the Mapoutahi wāhi tūpuna mapped area is consistent with the legal description of these sites in the *TRoNT* submission.
- 176. As with Huriawa, the area identified by *TRoNT* is smaller than the area mapped in the 2GP, and the s42A Report recommendation was that the wāhi tūpuna site remained as mapped in the 2GP. The Reporting Officer recommended that the additional words be added to the description of the site, but amended to reflect the fact that DCC cannot enforce a management plan for the area, as below (s42A Report, Section 4.3.22, pp. 54–55).

"Mapoutahi peninsula was vested fee simple in Te Rūnanga o Ngāi Tahu under the Ngāi Tahu Claims Settlement Act 1998; Te Rūnanga o Ngāi Tahu and Kāti Huirapa Rūnaka ki Puketeraki are working with the Department of Conservation to prepare a management plan for this area".

177. Mr Vial, in his written evidence, supported this approach.

## 3.9.3.2.1 Decision and decision reasons

178. We accept the submissions in part, and the relief recommended by the Reporting Officer to amend the description of wāhi tūpuna site A4.17, for the reasons outlined in the s42A Report as detailed above. This amendment is shown in Appendix 1 (MW 790.6). No amendment is made to the area mapped as A4.17.

## 3.9.4 Threats to wāhi tūpuna from adjacent land

- 179. Ngā Rūnanga (OS1071.16) noted that where restricted discretionary activities that may threaten a wāhi tūpuna are located outside the wāhi tūpuna, effects on Manawhenua are not identified as a matter of discretion, and therefore cannot be considered. To resolve this, they sought that wāhi tupuna, where "adjacent" activities are listed as a threat, are mapped more broadly, to allow consideration of these effects.
- 180. The s42A Report identified wāhi tūpuna sites that have threats from adjacent land as:
  - water bodies, being Matainaka/Hawksbury Lagoon, Te Tauraka Poti/Merton Tidal Arm, Blueskin Bay; Pūrākaunui, Otago Harbour and the Taieri River
  - two sites where threat of wilding tree spreading into them is an issue
  - the nohoaka site at Middlemarch, where reverse sensitivity effects from adjoining subdivision is an issue.
- 181. For the water body sites, the relevant threats are activities affecting water quality (for example, sediment entering the water) and loss of access to the coastal marine area. The Reporting Officer suggested two solutions: either map the sites to include a 20m buffer of land around them (consequential amendments required to assessment rules in the various zones in which the buffer falls) or expand the matters of discretion for non-compliance with the 'Setback from water bodies' performance standard (Rule 10.3.3) to include 'Effects on Manawhenua values' where the site is adjacent to a wāhi tūpuna site. This would require an amendment to various assessment rules and, while it would be inconsistent with the structure of the existing assessment rules, it would still achieve the desired outcome (s42A Report, Section 4.3.21, pp. 51-52).

## ANNEXURE C - Parties to be Served with Appeal

Respondent: Dunedin City Council

PO Box 5045 Dunedin 9054

2gpappeals@dcc.govt.nz

**Submitter**: AgResearch Limited

PO Box 97431 Manakau 2241

Attention: Graeme Mathieson

graeme.mathieson@emslimited.co.nz

Anthony Parata 1113 Coast Road RD 1

Waikouaiti 9471

Attention: Anthony Parata

tekainga@xtra.co.nz

Alan Brown PO Box 143 Dunedin

Attention: Campbell Hodgson

campbell.hodgson@gallawaycookallan.co.nz

Alan Clearwater and Sandra Clearwater Alistar Hope 101 Papanui Inlet Road RD 2

Dunedin 9077

Attention: Alan Clearwater and Sandra Clearwater Alistar Hope

s.clearwater@xtra.co.nz

Allan McLeary, Slyvia Violet McLeary and Farry & Co Trustees Limited (on behalf of McLeary Family Trust)

PO Box 5419 Moray Place

Dunedin 9058

Attention: Allan McLeary and Slyvia Violet McLeary

mnidd@farry.co.nz

Alison Rowena Beck 53 Canongate Dunedin Central Dunedin 9016

Attention: Alison Rowena Beck

hepcotago@xtra.co.nz

Alvin Chong 110 Clyde Street North Dunedin Dunedin 9016

Attention: Alvin Chong

paddycboarding@gmail.com

Andrew McSkimming 270 Blackhead Road RD 1 Dunedin 9076

Attention: Andrew McSkimming

mcskimming@actrix.co.nz

AnnieMarie Watson 270 Blackhead Road Dunedin 9076

Attention: Andrew Marie Watson

mcskimming@actrix.co.nz

Andrew Michael Waterworth 32 Tweed Street Roslyn Dunedin 9010

Attention: Andrew Michael Waterworth

Arthur St Neighbourhood Support 9/27 Arthur Street Dunedin 9016

Attention: Liz Angelo

Email: angelo.tekapo@gmail.com

Athol Parks 106 Gladstone Road North Mosgiel 9024

Attention: Athol Parks

Email: athol@citywalks.co.nz

Audrey Shearer 8 Glengyle Street Vauxhall Dunedin 9013

Attention: Audrey Shearer

Aurora Energy Limited PO Box 1404 Dunedin 9054

Attention: Joanne Dowd

joanne.dowd@thinkdelta.co.nz

Austin Gee 67 Warrender Street North Dunedin

Attention: Austin Gee

austin.gee@clear.net.nz

Barry Douglas 14 Jubilee Street Belleknowes Dunedin 9011

Attention: Barry Douglas

barrydouglas@xtra.co.nz

Barry Smaill PO Box 7113 Dunedin 9040

Attention: Barry Smaill

smaillbuild@ihug.co.nz

Barry James Williams PO Box 31 Middlemarch 9067

Attention: Barry James Williams

barryw@sfml.co.nz

Ben Graham PO Box 143 Dunedin

Attention: Bridget Irving

bridget.irving@gallawaycookallan.co.nz

Ben Sutherland 34A Field Street Upper Hutt 5019

Attention: Ben Sutherland

cheryl\_ben@vodafone.co.nz

Blackhead Quarries Ltd 11 Bedford Street St Dunedin 9012

Attention: Allan Cubitt

allan@cubittconsulting.co.nz

Bloemfarm 616 Highcliff Road RD 2 Dunedin 9077

Attention: Pieter and Sandra Bloem

bloemfarm@gmail.com

Blue Grass Limited 11 Bedford Street St Dunedin 9012

Attention: Allan Cubitt

allan@cubittconsulting.co.nz

Blueskin Projects Ltd 11 Bedford Street Dunedin 9012

Attention: Allan Cubitt

allan@cubittconsulting.co.nz

Brent Lovelock 77 Eglinton Road Mornington Dunedin 9011

Attention: Brent Lovelock

brent.lovelock@otago.ac.nz

Bruce Mark Norrish 171 Pigeon Flat Road Waitati 9085

Attention: Bruce Mark Norrish

bruce.norrish@gmail.com

Bronwyn Hegarty and James Hegarty 5 Cottle Street RD 2 Waitati 9085

Attention: Brownyn Hegarty and James Hegarty

bronwyn.hegarty@gmail.com

Bruce McLennan 3 Mornington Road Dunedin 9011

Attention: Bruce McLennan

mr.bruce.mclennan@gmail.com

Bruce Wayne Taylor 7 St James Place Dunedin 9018

Attention: Bruce Wayne Taylor

Burkhard and Marita Eisenlohr 600 Portobello Road RD 2 Dunedin 9077

Attention: Burkhard Eisenlohr

bmegp@xtra.co.nz

Burnside (Dunedin) Limited PO Box 5933 Dunedin 9058

Attention: Leon Hallett

leon.hallett@ppgroup.co.nz

Calder Stewart Development Limited Level 1, 123 Vogel Street Dunedin 9016

Attention: C/- Nigel Bryce

nigelb@4sight.co.nz

Cameron John Macaulay PO Box 5 Middlemarch 9067

Attention: Cameron John Macaulay

stephandcam@xtra.co.nz

Candida Savage 48 Melville Street Dunedin 9016

Attention: Candida Savage

candidas@hotmail.com

Capri Enterprises Limited PO Box 489 Dunedin 9054

Attention: C/- Megan Justice

megan.justice@mitchellpartnerships.co.nz

Carol Devine 6 View Street Dunedin 9016

Attention: Carol Devine

caroldevine@me.com

Chorus New Zealand Limited (Chorus) PO Box 3082 Shortland Street Auckland 1140

Attention: C/- Chris Horne

chris@incite.co.nz

Chris Kelliher 11 Bedford Street St Dunedin 9012 Attention: Allan Cubitt

allan@cubittconsulting.co.nz

Chris Stewart 30 Glen Street Milsons Point NSW 2061 Australia

Attention: Chris Stewart

christopherjstewart@rocketmail.com

Christian Jordan 66B Winters Road Redwood Christchurch 8051

Attention: Christian Jordan

christianpauljordan@hotmail.com

Christopher Dean Valentine 5 Grove Street Dunedin 9017

Attention: Christopher Dean Valentine

c.d.v@hotmail.com

Christopher Kilpatrick 140 Upper Junction Road Port Chalmers 9085

Attention: Christopher Kilpatrick

Christopher Ryalls 695 Outram-Mosgiel road RD 1 Outram 9073

Attention: Christopher Ryalls

Clifford Seque 102 Kenmure Road Mornington Dunedin 9011

Attention: Clifford Seque

seque@es.co.nz

Clifton Trust PO Box 143 Dunedin 9016

Attention: Campbell Hodgson

campbell.hodgson@gallawaycookallan.co.nz

Colin Weatherall 1118 Brighton Road Dunedin 9035

Attention: Colin Weatherall

colinweatherall@xtra.co.nz

Clutha District Council PO Box 25 Balclutha 9240

Attention: David Campbell

david.campbell@cluthadc.govt.nz

Construction Industry and Developers Association PO Box 5724 Dunedin 9058

Attention: C/- Emma Peters

emma@sweepconsultancy.co.nz

Craig Horne 11 Bedford Street St Dunedin 9012

Attention: Allan Cubitt

allan@cubittconsulting.co.nz

CTW Holdings Limited 11 Bedford Street Dunedin 9012

Attention: Allan Cubitt

allan@cubittconsulting.co.nz

Cyril Blackwell 17 Takahe Terrace Saint Leonards Dunedin 9022

Attention: Cyril Blackwell

lekelly.mailbox@gmail.com

David Murray 160 Rolla Street Normanby Dunedin 9010

Attention: David Murray

mevad@xtra.co.nz

David Tordoff 415 Portobello Road Dunedin 9077

Attention: David Tordoff

david.tordoff@xtra.co.nz

David Frew C/O Counter Delivery Middlemarch Post Centre Middlemarch 9067

Attention: David Frew

jock876@yahoo.co.nz

David Graham 22 Holyport Close Dunedin 9018

Attention: David Graham

grahamde@xtra.co.nz

David Hiom and Kerry Hiom 405 Saddle Hill Road RD 1 Dunedin 9076

Attention: David Hiom Kerry Hiom

hioms@xtra.co.nz

David More and Susan More 26 Spiers Road Dunedin 9010

Attention: David More and Susan More

davidmore@clear.net.nz

David Roy Hardisty 4 King Street RD 1 Waikouaiti 9471

Attention: David Roy Hardisty

Denise von Hardenbroek 110 Kempshall Rd Outram 9073

Attention: Denise von Hardenbroek

hardenbroek@xtra.co.nz

Dianne Reid PO Box 143 Dunedin 9016

Attention: Bridget Irving

bridget.irving@gallawaycookallan.co.nz

Douglas Hall 553 North Road North East Valley Dunedin 9010

Attention: Douglas Hall

Dowling Street Property Trust PO Box 5589 Dunedin 9058

Attention: C/- Van Aart Sycamore Lawyers

sboock@vslawyers.co.nz

Dunedin Club PO Box 1345 Dunedin 9054

Attention: Gerard DeCourcy

gerard@downiestewart.co.nz

Dunedin Rural Development Inc. PO Box 5990 Dunedin 9058

Attention: Murray J Harris

murray@landandforestconsultants.co.nz

East Otago Taiapure Management Committee 121 Grimness Street Waikouaiti 9471

Attention: Brendan Flack

paradisesouth@xtra.co.nz

Egg Producers Federation of New Zealand PO Box 2313 Wellington 6140

Attention: Poul Israelson

p.israelson@harrisongrierson.com

Elm Tourism Limited
19 Irvine Road The Cove RD 2
Dunedin 9077

Attention: Brian Richard Templeton

elmtourism@xtra.co.nz

Elaine Snell Family Trust PO Box 143 Dunedin 9016

Attention: C/- Campbell Hodgson

campbell.hodgson@gallawaycookallan.co.nz

Elizabeth Kerr 5/5 Pitt Street North Dunedin Dunedin 9016

Attention: Elizabeth Kerr

ejkerr@ihug.co.nz

Engineering New Zealand (formerly The Institution of Professional Engineers NZ)
50 Customhouse
Wellington

Attention: Cindy Jemmett cindy.jemmett@engineeringnz.org

Federated Farmers of New Zealand PO Box 5242 Dunedin 9058

Attention: Caroline Ryder and Kim Reilly

cryder@fedfarm.org.nz; kreilly@fedfarm.org.nz

Foodstuffs South Island Properties Limited 15 Worcester Boulevard Christchurch 8013

Attention: C/- Chris Fowler

chris.fowler@adderleyhead.co.nz

Fonterra Limited PO Box 8/DX CX10085 Auckland 1140

Attention: Tom Atkins

tom.atkins@russellmcveagh.com

Forest and Bird NZ PO Box 6230 Dunedin 9059

Attention: Sue Maturin

s.maturin@forestandbird.org.nz

Francesse Middleton 70 Mana Esplanade New Zealand, 5026

Attention: Francesse Middleton

Geoff Scurr Contracting Limited PO Box 143 Dunedin 9016

Attention: Campbell Hodgson

campbell.hodgson@gallawaycookallan.co.nz

G & J Sommers Edgar 11 Bedford Street Dunedin 9012

Attention: Allan Cubitt

allan@cubittconsulting.co.nz

Gladstone Family Trust 99 Gladstone Road Mosgiel 9024 Attention: David Johnston djohnston@vodafone.co.nz

Glenelg Gospel Trust 11 Bedford Street St Dunedin 9012

Attention: Allan Cubitt

allan@cubittconsulting.co.nz

Grady Cameron 14 Polwarth Road Dunedin 9010

Attention: Grady Cameron

grady.cameron@thinkdelta.co.nz

Graham and Nothburga Prime 394 Pigeon Flat Road RD 2 Waitati 9085

Attention: Graham and Nothburga Prime

grnmpri@unifone.net.nz

Graham Street Investments Limited Flat 6/51 Manor Place Fern Hill Dunedin 9016

Attention: Ted Ottrey

Grant Neilson
2 Dover Street Pinehill
Dunedin 9010

Attention: Grant Neilson

neilson\_grant@hotmail.com

Greg and Denise Powell 785 Portobello Road Dunedin 9014

Attention: Greg and Denise Powell

powell.castle@paradise.net.nz

Greg and Glenise Hyslop 179 Kirks Drain Road RD 1 Dunedin 9073

Attention: Greg and Glenise Hyslop

potts2000@xtra.co.nz

Harboursides and Peninsula Preservation Coalition 30 Howard Street Macandrew Bay Dunedin 9014

Attention: Craig Werner

craigwerner.ww@gmail.com

Harvey Norman Properties (NZ) Limited PO Box 90842 Victoria Street West Auckland 1142

Attention: C/- Daniel Shao

daniel.shao@hainesplanning.co.nz

Hawkdun Properties Ltd and Palmer and Sons Ltd PO Box 143 Dunedin 9016

Attention: C/- Bridget Irving

bridget.irving@gallawaycookallan.co.nz; campbell.hodgson@gallawaycookallan.co.nz

Hawkdun Properties Ltd and Palmer and Sons Ltd PO Box 143 Dunedin 9016

Attention: C/- Bridget Irving

bridget.irving@gallawaycookallan.co.nz; campbell.hodgson@gallawaycookallan.co.nz

Hawkdun Properties Ltd PO Box 5349 Moray Place Dunedin 9058

Attention: C/- Alistair Broad

albroad@xtra.co.nz

Helen Skinner PO Box 5427 Moray Place Dunedin 9058

Attention: Helen Skinner/ Joseph O'Neill

janeskinner50@gmail.com

Heritage New Zealand /Otago and Southland Office PO Box 5467 Dunedin 9058

Attention: Jane O'Dea

jodea@heritage.org.nz

Hilary and Michael Andrewes 40 Heriot Row City Rise Dunedin 9016

Attention: Hilary and Michael Andrewes

handmandrewes@xtra.co.nz

Hillside Forestry Limited 504 Flagstaff - Whare Flat Road RD 2 Mosgiel 9092

Attention: P Schinkelshoek

hilnewby@hotmail.com

Horticulture New Zealand PO Box 10232 The Terrace Wellington 6143

Attention: Rachel McClung

Rachel.McClung@hortnz.co.nz

Howard Saunders 292 York Place City Rise Dunedin 9016

Attention: Howard Saunders

howard.saunders@vodafone.co.nz

lan H Bryant 825 Centre Road 9073 New Zealand

Attention: Ian H Bryant

ian.bryant@xtra.co.nz

Irene Mosley 42 Law Road Mosgiel 9092

Attention: Irene Mosley

sjm93@xtra.co.nz

Ivan Court 285 Lincoln Rolleston Road Christchurch 7678

Attention: Ivan Court

barb.ivn@xtra.co.nz

Jack Austin PO Box 1 Port Chalmers Port Chalmers 9050

Attention: Jack Austin

jaxresources@hotmail.com

Jackie Gillies + Associates 44 Beach Street Queenstown

Attention: Jackie Gillies

jackie@jackiegillies.co.nz

James Fraser 60 Mt Grand Road Dunedin 9076

Attention: James Fraser

fraser\_springdale@xtra.co.nz

Jane Mcleod 231 Dukes Rd Dunedin 9092

Attention: Jane Mcleod

janemcleod42@gmail.com

Jason Cockerill 331 Big Stone Road Brighton 9091

Attention: Jason Cockerill

bronjas@xtra.co.nz

Jeremy Noble 157 Wakari Road Helensburgh Dunedin 9010

Attention: Jeremy Noble

jeremyknoble@yahoo.co.nz

Jeffrey Herkt 9 Clark Street Dunedin Central Dunedin 9016

Attention: Jeffrey Herkt

jandt118@gmail.com

Jeremy Shearer 54 Doon Street Vauxhall Dunedin 9013

Attention: Jeremy Shearer

jeremy.shearer@xtra.co.nz

Jesse Price 5a Oates street Kaikorai Valley Dunedin 9010

Attention: Jesse Price

tjpgold@gmail.com

Joel A Vanderburg C/O Counter Delivery Karitane Post Waikouaiti 9440 Attention: Joel A Vanderburg

vburg@es.co.nz

Jo Galer 9 Farquharson Street Dunedin 9010

Attention: Jo Galer

joanne.galer@otago.ac.nz

John Buchan 11 Bedford Street St Dunedin 9012

Attention: Allan Cubitt

allan@cubittconsulting.co.nz

John and Clare Pascoe 189 York Place Dunedin 9016

Attention: John and Clare Pascoe

clare.pascoe.dn@gmail.com

John Carruthers 7072 Hyde-Middlemarch Road Middlemarch 9596

Attention: John Carruthers

John's Furniture Warehouse 25 Stafford Street Dunedin Central Dunedin 9016

Attention: Matthew Williamson

matt@furniturewarehouse.co.nz

John Heydon 146 Taieri Mouth Road Brighton 9091

Attention: John Heydon

heydon.family@xtra.co.nz

John Scott PO Box 143 Dunedin Dunedin 9016

Attention: C/- Bridget Irving

bridget.irving@gallawaycookallan.co.nz

Josephine Dodd 17 Royal Terrace Dunedin 9016 Attention: Josephine Dodd

jo.dodd@xtra.co.nz

John Thom 58 Reservoir Road Waikouaiti 9471

Attention: John Thom

Joy Ruth McMiken 12 Adam Street City Rise Dunedin 9016

Attention: Joy Ruth McMiken

jrmcmiken@icloud.com

JW Bradley 43A Maungarei Road Remuera Auckland 1050

Attention: JW Bradley

jim.w.bradley@mwhglobal.com

Kāti Huirapa Rūnaka ki Puketeraki and Te Rūnanga o Ōtākou PO Box 446 Dunedin 9054

Attention: Tim Vial

tim@ktkoltd.co.nz

Kevin Colbert 1/3 View Street Dunedin 9016

Attention: Kevin Colbert

kc633663@gmail.com

Kim and Diane Rapley 186 Taieri Mouth Road Kuri Bush Dunedin 9091

Attention: Kim and Diane Rapley

kimanddiane@gmail.com

Kimberly John Taylor 11 Bedford Street St Dunedin 9012

Attention: Allan Cubitt

allan@cubittconsulting.co.nz

KiwiRail Holdings Limited PO Box 593 Wellington 6140 Attention: Rebecca Beals

Rebecca.Beals@kiwirail.co.nz

Knox and Salmond Colleges Board 19 Knox Street North East Valley Dunedin 9010

Attention: David Richardson

board@knoxandsalmondcollege.org

Lawrence Taylor 87 Seal Point Road Dunedin 9077

Attention: Lawrence Taylor

Lindsay Dempster, Nic Dempster, Simon Pointer, James Dempster, Sarah Dempster 58 Reservoir Road Waikouaiti 9471

Attention: Lindsay Dempster

margaret.dempster@gmail.com

Lindsay Carruthers 307 Ngapuna Road Middlemarch 9596

Attention: Lindsay Carruthers

Liz Angelo 9/27 Arthur Street Dunedin 9016

Attention: Arthur St Neighbourhood Support

angelo.tekapo@gmail.com

Liz McLennan 161 Hall Road Sawyers Bay Port Chalmers 9023

Attention: Liz McLennan

Imclennan@intechsoftware.co.nz

Louise Croot 520 Highgate Dunedin 9010

Attention: Louise Croot

Imcroot@xtra.co.nz

Louise Foord, Charlotte Morris and Hazel Renn 190 Malvern Street Woodhaugh Dunedin 9010

Attention: Louise Foord, Charlotte Morris and Hazel Renn

charlotte.morris@clear.net.nz

Liz McLennan 161 Hall Road Dunedin 9023

Attention: Liz McLennan

Imclennan@intechsoftware.co.nz

Lynnore Joan Templeton 175 Mt Stoker Road Middlemarch 9598

Attention: Lynnore Joan Templeton

info@therocks.co.nz

Mainland Property 2004 Limited. 11 Bedford Street St Dunedin 9012

Attention: Allan Cubitt

allan@cubittconsulting.co.nz

Mainland Poultry Canterbury Limited PO Box 143 Dunedin 9016

Attention: C/- Phil Page

phil.page@gallawaycookallan.co.nz

Malcolm & Rosemary McQueen 20 Elder Street Dunedin

Attention: Malcolm McQueen

malcolm1@orcon.net.nz

Margaret Davidson 740 G George Street Dunedin 9016

Attention: Margaret Davidson

megdavidson@actrix.co.nz

Mark and Rayna Dickson PO Box 53 Waitati 9069

Attention: Mark and Rayna Dickson

waitatistores@gmail.com

Mark Lauder 287 Green Island Bush Road Green Island 9076 Dunedin Attention: Mark Lauder mblauder@gmail.com

Marilyn Willis 55 Royal Terrace Dunedin Central Dunedin 9016

Attention: Marilyn Willis

marilyn.a.willis@icloud.com

Marlene Du Toit Parks 28 Ralston Street Mosgiel 9092

Attention: Marlene Du Toit Parks

marlenedutoit@hotmail.com

Marrafin Trust 693 Waitati Valley Road Waitati 9085

Attention: Mark Spencer

spendecon@xtra.co.nz

Mathew O'Connell PO Box 143 Dunedin 9016

Attention: C/- Bridget Irving

bridget.irving@gallawaycookallan.co.nz; campbell.hodgson@gallawaycookallan.co.nz

Maurice Cook 9079 Eton Street Ranfurly 9397

Attention: Maurice Cook

Mauricehcook@hotmail.com

Maurice Prendergast 1A Inglis Street Mosgiel 9024

Attention: Maurice Prendergast

McKeown Group Limited 11 Bedford Street St Clair Dunedin 9012

Attention: C/- Allan Cubitt

allan@cubittconsulting.co.nz

Meats of New Zealand 489 East Taieri-Allanton Road Mosgiel 9092 Attention: John Baker pip.gardner@xtra.co.nz

Megan Ross 21 Columba Avenue Dunedin 9012

Attention: Megan Ross

4meganross@gmail.com

Michael O'Neill PO Box 909 Dunedin 9054

Attention: Michael O'Neill

mike@ond.co.nz

Mike Geraghty 5500 Sutton Clarkes Junction Road Middlemarch 9597

Attention: Mike Geraghty

Mr & Mrs D Allen 21 Saddle Hill Road Fairfield Dunedin 9076

Attention: Mr & Mrs D Allen

dougallenfencing@yahoo.co.nz

Moi Bien Investments Ltd 11 Bedford Street St Dunedin 9012

Attention: Allan Cubitt

allan@cubittconsulting.co.nz

Murray Soal 427 Waitati Valley Road Waitati 9085

Attention: Murray Soal

hillcrestfarm@xtra.co.nz

Neil Grant 6878 Hyde-Middlemarch Road RD 1 Middlemarch 9596

Attention: Neil Grant

neil\_glencreag@xtra.co.nz

Neville Hall and Julie Hall 1 Tolcarne Ave Dunedin 9010 Attention: Neville Hall

nanking@ihug.co.nz New Zealand Defence Force Private Bag 902 Trentham Upper Hutt 5140

Attention: Rob Owen

robert.owen@nzdf.mil.nz; rebecca.davies@nzdf.mil.nz

New Zealand Defence Force PO Box 2083 Wellington 6140

Attention: C/- Sara McMillan

robert.owen@nzdf.mil.nz; rebecca.davies@nzdf.mil.nz

New Zealand Fire Service Commission PO Box 6345 Auckland 1141

Attention: Alice Burnett

alice.burnett@beca.com

New Zealand Transport Agency (NZTA) PO Box 5245 Dunedin 9058

Attention: Kirsten Tebbutt

planning-dunedin@nzta.govt.nz

New Zealand Institute of Surveyors – Costal Otago Branch PO Box 235 Dunedin 9054

Attention: C/- Maaike Duncan

maaike@terramark.co.nz

Noeline Knox 16 Tomahawk Road Dunedin

Attention: Noeline Knox

Nwknox@xtra.co.nz

Oceana Gold (New Zealand) Limited 22 MacLaggan Street Dunedin 9016

Attention: Jackie St John

jackie.stjohn@oceanagold.com

Otago Fish and Game Council PO Box 76 Dunedin 9054 Attention: Otago Fish and Game Council

p.wilson@fish-game.org.nz

Otago Museum Trust Board PO Box 6202 Dunedin

Attention: Murray Bayly

murray.bayly@otagomuseum.nz

Otago Peninsula Community Board 2 Sherwood Street Dunedin

Attention: Paul Pope

paul.peninsula@xtra.co.nz

Otago Railway and Locomotive Society Inc. PO Box 1297
Dunedin

Attention: Shane Murray

shane@farra.co.nz

Otago Regional Council Private Bag 1954 Dunedin 9054

Attention: Warren Hanley

warren.hanley@orc.govt.nz

Owain Morris 52 Allenby Avenue Dunedin

Attention: Owain Morris

owainjmorris@xtra.co.nz

Owen F Duffy 77 Warrender Street Dunedin

Attention: Owen F Duffy

Patsy Eames 34 Portobello Road Dunedin 9013

Attention: Patsy Eames

patsy@jaeames.com

Penguin Place Limited 25 Pakihau Road RD 2 Dunedin 9077 Attention: Nicola McGrouther

nic.brian@xtra.co.nz Peninsula Holdings Trust PO Box 402 Dunedin 9054

Attention: Steve Clearwater

scc@unifone.net.nz

Peter Entwisle 96 Cargill Street Dunedin

Attention: Peter Entwisle

portdanielpress@actrix.co.nz

Peter Wilson PO Box 5772 Dunedin 9058

Attention: Peter Wilson

peter@edinburghrealty.co.nz

Philip Gilchrist 6 Emerson Street Dunedin

Attention: Philip Gilchrist

info@philipgilchrist.com

Pieter Max van Ammers PO Box 6548 Dunedin

Attention: Pieter Max van Ammers

pva@xtra.co.nz

Port Otago Limited PO Box 8 Port Chalmers 9050

Attention: Port Otago Limited

LMcLachlan@portotago.co.nz

Property Council New Zealand PO Box 1033 Auckland

Attention: Alexis Voutratzis

alex@propertynz.co.nz

Public Trust N/A

N/A

Attention: Lee Sinclair

lee.sinclair@publictrust.co.nz

Purakaunui Environment Group Inc PO Box 10 Port Chalmers 9050

Attention: Robyn Marsh

peginco@gmail.com

Radio New Zealand Limited PO Box 123 Wellington 6140

Attention: Gary Fowles

gary.fowles@radionz.co.nz

Ray Kean PO Box 56 Mosgiel 9053

Attention: C/- Craig Horne

crhorne@xtra.co.nz

Raymond and Evelyn Beardsmore 167 McDonald Road RD 1 Outram 9073

Attention: Raymond and Evelyn Beardsmore

Raymond Grant Tisdall 452 Gladbrook Road Middlemarch 9597

Attention: Raymond Grant Tisdall

Rebecca Jane Wilde 776 Weedons Ross Road West Melton 7618

Attention: Rebecca Jane Wilde

rebecca\_morris2077@icloud.com

Robert Thornton 45 Kelvin Road Dunedin

Attention: Robert Thornton

robthornton@slingshot.co.nz

Robert Francis Wyber 18 Brownville Crescent Maori Hill Dunedin 9010 Attention: Robert Francis Wyber

bwyber@xtra.co.nz

Robert George and Sharron Margaret Morris 143 Seal Point Dunedin 9077

Attention: Robert George and Sharron Margaret Morris

sharron\_n\_bob@clear.net.nz

Robin Donald Graham 227 York Place Dunedin

Attention: Robin Donald Graham

robin.graham@telferyoung.com

Robin John Shaw Thomas 17B Mataora Road Kenmure Dunedin 9011

Attention: Robin John Shaw Thomas

robin.thomas@xtra.co.nz

Robyn and Stephan Smith PO Box 143 Dunedin 9016

Attention: Robyn and Stephan Smith

bridget.irving@gallawaycookallan.co.nz

Malcolm & Rosemary McQueen 20 Elder Street Dunedin 9016

Dunedin 9016

Attention: Malcolm & Rosemary McQueen

malcolm1@orcon.net.nz

Rosalind Whiting 80 Duncan Street Dunedin

Attention: Rosalind Whiting

Rosemarie Smith 24 Hart Street Dunedin

Attention: Rosemarie Smith

rvoland@ihug.co.nz

Ross Roy 1B Snowdon Street 9092 Mosgiel

Attention: Ross Roy

ross.steph@xtra.co.nz

Ross Gordon & Patricia Ann Allen 261 Green Island Bush Road Dunedin 9076

Attention: Ross Gordon & Patricia Ann Allen

pat.allen@xtra.co.nz

Royal/Pitt/Heriot Residential Heritage Precinct Protection Inc 55 Royal Terrace Dunedin

Attention: Marilyn Willis

marilyn.a.willis@icloud.com

Rural Contractors New Zealand Incorporated PO Box 97431
Manukau City Auckland 2241

Attention: C/- Graeme Mathieson

graeme.mathieson@emslimited.co.nz

Salisbury Park Ltd 11 Bedford Street St Dunedin 9012

Attention: C/- Allan Cubitt

allan@cubittconsulting.co.nz

Saddle Views Estate Limited 11 Bedford Street St Dunedin 9012

Attention: Allan Cubitt

allan@cubittconsulting.co.nz

Sally Dicey 26 Centre Road Dunedin 9077

Attention: Sally Dicey

sallydicey@ahika.co.nz

Save the Otago Peninsula PO Box 23 Portobello Dunedin 9048

Attention: Lala Frazer

stopincsoc@gmail.com

Scenic Circle Hotels Limited PO Box 489 Dunedin

Attention: Megan Justice

megan.justice@mitchellpartnerships.co.nz

Scroggs Hill Farm Limited 252 Scroggs Hill Road Dunedin 9031

Attention: Ross McLeary

scroggshillfarm@outlook.co.nz

Shane Johnston and Sharee Watts 517 Mount Cargill Road RD 2 Waitati 9085

Attention: Shane Johnston and Sharee Watts

nz\_yeehaa@yahoo.com

Southern District Health Board C/O Public Health South Private Bag 1921 Dunedin

Attention: Andrew Shand

andrew.shand@southerndhb.govt.nz

Southern Heritage Trust & City Rise Up 12 Royal Terrace Dunedin

Attention: Ann Barsby

barsby@xtra.co.nz

Southern Property Investment Trust PO Box 6191 Dunedin 9010

Attention: Dr Allan Rodgers

southern\_property@yahoo.com

Spark New Zealand Trading Limited PO Box 3082 Auckland

Attention: Chris Horne

chris@incite.co.nz

Stephen Macknight PO Box 343 Dunedin

Attention: Stephen Macknight

steve@smacknight.co.nz

Strath Taieri Community Board PO Box 31 Middlemarch 9067

Attention: Barry Williams

barryw@sfml.co.nz

Stride Property Limited PO Box 90842 Auckland

Attention: Daniel Shao

daniel.shao@hainesplanning.co.nz

Susannah Adair Staley 15 Takahe Terrace Dunedin

Attention: Susannah Adair Staley

Susie@staleycardoza.co.nz

Te Rūnanga o Ngai Tahu PO Box 13046 Christchurch 8024

Attention: Aaron Leith

aaron.leith@ngaitahu.iwi.nz

Terry Wilson N/A N/A

Attention: Terry Wilson

TWW@slingshot.co.nz

Teresa Ann Dynes PO Box 13192 Dunedin 9052

Attention: Teresa Ann Dynes

The Roman Catholic Bishop of the Diocese of Dunedin Private Bag 1941 Dunedin

Attention: William Haydon

billh@cdd.org.nz

Tim Buscall 95 Norwood Street Dunedin 9010

Attention: Tim Buscall

Timothy George Morris 776 Weedons Ross Road West Melton 7618

Attention: Timothy George Morris

Timothy Morris 143 Seal Point Road Sandymount RD 2 Dunedin 9077

Attention: Timothy Morris

tmorris@tonkintaylor.co.nz

Tony McFadgen 440 Blackhead Road RD 1 Dunedin 9076

Attention: Tony McFadgen

tony.mcfadgen@a1homes.co.nz

Transpower New Zealand Limited PO Box 5005 Dunedin 9058

Attention: Aileen Craw

aileen.craw@beca.com

Tussock Top Farm Ltd 11 Bedford Street St Dunedin 9012

Attention: Allan Cubitt

allan@cubittconsulting.co.nz

University of Otago Property Services Division PO Box 56 Dunedin 9054

Attention: Murray Brass

murray.brass@otago.ac.nz

Veronica Dalloway 25 Brownville Crescent Dunedin 9010

Attention: Veronica Dalloway

zofinz@gmail.com

Vicky Carthew 28a Evans Street Dunedin 9010

Attention: Vicky Carthew

Viewfield Trust 190 Brighton Road Dunedin 9018

Attention: Viewfield Trust

venables10@xtra.co.nz

Vodafone NZ Ltd Private Bag 92143 West Auckland 1142

Attention: Colin Clune

colin.clune@vodafone.com

Vodafone NZ Ltd PO Box 3082 Auckland 1140 Attention: C/- Chris Horne

chris@incite.co.nz

Warren Wilson 689 Aramoana Road 9082 New Zealand

Attention: Warren Wilson

waipuna689@gmail.com

Wallace Corporation Limited PO Box 3077 Hamilton 3240

Attention: Jaime Lomas

jaime.lomas@harkness.co.nz

Waste Management (NZ) Limited PO Box 5271 Wellesley Street Auckland 1141

Attention: Andrea Brabant

abrabant@tonkintaylor.co.nz

William Glasson Clark 47 Spiers Road Dunedin 9010

Attention: William Glasson Clark

sandraandbill@ihug.co.nz

Yellow-eyed Penguin Trust PO Box 5409 Dunedin 9058

Attention: Sue Murray

Enquiries@yeptrust.org.nz