



Memorandum

TO: Madeline Seeley, Planner

FROM: Luke McKinlay, Urban Designer

DATE: 10-Aug-2017

SUBJECT: Land Use Consent - Description
LUC-2017-319 - 72 Gordon Road Mosgiel, 76 Gordon Road Mosgiel

Hi Maddy,

This memorandum is in response to a request for comment on an application to redevelop the existing BP service station at 72-76 Gordon Road and expand onto the adjoining site at 70 Gordon Road by constructing a new BP Connect service station and car wash. The existing workshop is to be demolished.

Elements of the proposal with the potential to effect visual and urban amenity values are identified as follows:

Forecourt

- Eight fuel dispensers in an eight lane configuration providing 16 filling positions.
- A canopy (14m wide, 32m long, 6.0m high) with LED down-lights above the dispensers.

Retail Shop

- The proposed service station retail shop will have a building footprint of approximately 22.8m x 12.8m (292m² in area) and will be approximately 4.9m high.

Carwash

- A carwash will be constructed near the southern boundary of the site. It will have a footprint of approximately 11.0m x 6.5m with a height of approximately 4.0m.

Signage

- One main pylon sign is proposed within the garden area to the south of the southernmost vehicle crossing. It will be 9.0m high and 2.28m wide and will be internally illuminated. The sign will be double sided and will have a total surface area of 20.25m². In addition, there will be signage associated with the retail shop, canopy and car wash.

Hours of Operation

- The site will operate 24 hours a day and seven days per week. It is proposed that the car wash and vacuum will operate between 7:00am to 9:00pm Monday to Friday and 8:00am to 9:00pm Saturday, Sunday and statutory holidays.

Landscaping

- Planting is proposed along the road frontage and both side boundaries of the site. These areas will be planted with locally sourced low growing native species in order to maintain visibility at the vehicle crossings. A 2m high acoustic timber fence will be erected along all three internal boundaries of the site. The fence will drop to 1m in height from the north eastern corner of the shop to the road boundary in order to maintain visibility for vehicles exiting the site.

Construction

- Construction activities, including earthworks and dewatering will be undertaken in accordance with the Environmental Management Plan attached in Appendix D of the

application. It is estimated that the redevelopment will take approximately 12-16 weeks to complete.

Relevant Planning Matters

The site is located within the Residential 2 Zone of the District Plan.

Because the applicant is proposing to expand onto the adjoining site to the south, existing use rights associated with the current operation of the service station will be lost and consent is required as a non-complying activity pursuant to Rule 8.8.6 of the Residential 2 Zone.

Relevant planning matters, restricted to the limited scope of urban amenity, include the following:

Chapter 8 - Residential

8.13.3 Bulk and Location of Buildings or Structures

The degree to which the height, bulk and location of any building or structure has an effect on the surrounding environment, including people, buildings and amenity and, where appropriate, meets Council's objectives in respect of the Townscape Section and the degree to which the proposal recognises existing buildings and constraints on the site.

8.13.5 Amenity Values and Character

The extent to which the proposal affects the amenity values and character of any area, including the design and appearance of any structure in relation to any other structures in the immediate vicinity. A description of the main characteristics of each area is given in Section 8.5.

8.13.6 Design and Appearance of Buildings, Structures, Landscaping and Consideration of Site Topography

(i) The degree to which the design and appearance of any buildings, structures, landscaping or site topography has an adverse effect on the character and amenity of residential areas in terms of the immediate neighbourhood.

(ii) The extent to which the design maintains and preserves the general residential scale and character in the surrounding area.

8.14 Anticipated Environmental Results

The anticipated environmental results are:

8.14.1

The current level of residential amenity of existing residential areas, rural townships and settlements is maintained or enhanced.

8.14.5

The amenity of neighbourhoods in residential areas is maintained or enhanced.

8.14.14

Adverse effects of development and activities on adjoining residential sites are minimised.

Chapter 19 - Signs

Rule 19.5.4 Signs Permitted in the Residential 1, 2, 5, and 6 Zones

Signs associated with a permitted activity provided that there shall be one sign per site and:

(i) The sign shall not exceed 0.5 m² in area.

(ii) Signs may denote only the name, character or purpose of the permitted activity. Logos on the signs shall be limited to those of the occupant of the site.

(iii) Signs shall not be illuminated.

Existing site context

The proposed site is located at 70-76 Gordon Road, Mosgiel. A service station currently operates from 72 Gordon Road and consists of a workshop, small retail shop, forecourt with fuel dispensers and canopy, LPG tanks, Underground tanks and a 7.5m pylon sign. 70 Gordon Road was previously occupied by a residential dwelling, which has recently been demolished, leaving the site currently vacant. 76 Gordon Rd comprises a metaled yard used by heavy vehicles for parking and manoeuvring in order to get access to the diesel pump adjacent to the shop.

The site is located to the south of the commercial centre of Mosgiel. There are residential properties adjoining the site to the south and west, while to the north there is a vet practice. Residential dwellings and a gospel hall are located on the opposite side of Gordon Road. In the wider surrounding area, there is a mix of land uses including a Christian school, church, motels, a plumber's yard and tyre service shop.

Gordon Road is a busy thoroughfare, providing the main entrance to the commercial centre of Mosgiel from Dunedin. The front sections of nearby residential dwellings on Gordon Road vary in the extent of existing vegetation and type of boundary fencing. While 71 and 73 Gordon Road contain tall mature amenity planting, the flats at 69 Gordon Road and the dwellings at 68 and 77 Gordon Road are relatively open to the street. Fences are typically low or visually permeable. The sections behind the site on Irvine road are typically separated from the site by a tall fence.

Assessment of Effects

Effects of this application on visual and urban amenity values are related to the expansion of the service station, which will include new features not currently present on the site and the extension of trading hours to a 24hour operation. The site will expand to occupy a residential section (zoned residential 2 under both the operative district plan and proposed second generation plan) with potential localised effects on nearby residential properties.

Gordon Road is a busy thoroughfare, with relatively high volumes of traffic and a mix of land-uses, which influence existing amenity values. Nevertheless, there is a requirement under the operative district plan to maintain or enhance the amenity of existing residential areas (8.14.5) and minimise adverse effects of development (8.14.14).

For those properties that border the site to the west on Irvine road, it is considered that the proposed development will not cause unacceptable adverse effects on their existing visual amenity. The eastern boundaries of these sections are currently lined by relatively tall fencing. The proposed 2m high timber acoustic fence will be somewhat higher than the existing fences in places and will provide appropriate visual screening of the expanded service station. It is noted that all structures within the site meet the required building setbacks and height recession planes. Further, the narrow faces of the canopy, shop and carwash will face in the direction of these properties, reducing the apparent visual bulk of the development.

Effects will be somewhat more pronounced from properties which adjoin 70 Gordon Road to the west and south east (41a Irvine Street, 2 Mure Street) given that these sections currently adjoin a residential section. However, the visual effects will largely be mitigated by the acoustic fence.

For residents opposite the site, the proposed development will likely form a more noticeable feature than the existing service station due to the increase in the scale of the operation, the proposed relocation of the shop and pylon sign and the proposed extension of hours. Effects are expected to be most noticeable from the flats at 69 Gordon Road, located opposite the proposed carwash facility and pylon sign, and 77 Gordon Road, located opposite the proposed shop. From 69 Gordon Road, unobstructed views will be afforded towards the carwash. This will represent a shift in visual character from the pre-existing view towards a residential section. While it is acknowledged that the carwash will have more restricted hours of operation than the service station (7am-9pm), it is considered that the movement of cars

through the car wash in the direction of 69 Gordon Road will have some adverse effects on the visual amenity and privacy of the residents of this property.

For the residents of 77 Gordon Road, existing views to the metaled yard will be replaced with views towards the eastern face of the proposed shop. While the proposed development will create a more enclosed view from 77 Gordon Road, existing amenity derived from views of the metaled yard and parked/manoeuvring vehicles are relatively low. As such, effects of the proposed development on existing visual amenity from this location are considered to be low.

From 68 Gordon Road effects will be associated with the replacement of an existing hedge with an acoustic timber fence and the installation of a 9m pylon sign within 70 Gordon Road. With regards to the fence, it is considered that it will screen views of vehicles using the carwash and service station from 68 Gordon Road and the majority of the carwash itself. There may be some minor adverse effects associated with the removal of the hedge. A more noticeable effect on visual amenity will be associated with the new pylon sign.

Whereas the existing 7.5m sign is located approximately 70m from the northern boundary of 68 Gordon Road, the proposed sign will be only 16m from this boundary. In the proposed location, the new sign, which will be aligned perpendicular to the road, will likely form a prominent feature from locations within 68 Gordon Road.

Potential adverse effects of the sign on the residents of 68 Gordon Road are primarily related to the close proximity of the sign, its large surface area (20.25m²) and the fact that it will be illuminated. In combination, these features will draw attention to the sign, detracting from the pre-existing more residential character of views. The rules of the Operative District Plan regarding permitted signage in Residential 2 zoned land allow a maximum size of 0.5m² and no sign illumination (Rule 19.5.4). As such, the sign greatly exceeds the expectations of the zone regarding signage and will contrast with the pre-existing residential character of 70 Gordon Road.

While it is likely that the proposed 2m high acoustic fence and the walls of the carwash will provide some visual screening of the sign and wider site features, such as the canopy, the sign is likely to be at least partially visible. Additional screening of the sign could be provided by planting within the 3m wide garden area on the southern boundary of the site. However, tall planting in this location would also have the effect of shading the northern side of the dwelling at 68 Gordon Rd and northern parts of the section.

It is noted that the potential adverse visual amenity effects of the proposed pylon sign on the residents of 68 Gordon Road could be reduced by maintaining the existing location of the sign, near the western boundary of 72 Gordon Road, rather than the proposed location in front of the carwash.

With the exception of effects from 68 Gordon Road, effects of the pylon sign on the wider surrounding area are considered to be relatively minor. While it will be noticeable from 69 Gordon Road, opposite the site, only the narrow profile of the sign will be visible, limiting its effect on existing visual amenity. It is acknowledged that the existing pylon sign provides an existing context within which the effects of the proposed sign may be assessed. At a broader scale, the proposed sign, while larger than the existing sign, is unlikely to have notable effects on the amenity values of passing motorists and/or the wider surrounding residential population of Mosgiel, for whom the new sign will likely become an accepted part of the Gordon Road streetscape.

Lighting

It is noted that the lighting assessment appended to the application considers the effects of the canopy lighting only, it does not consider the effects of the illuminated pylon sign. It is considered that the potential adverse visual amenity effects of the pylon sign include the effects of illumination in addition to the size and visual character of the sign.

Proposed Mitigation

It is proposed by the applicant that low native planting will line the southern and northern boundaries and garden beds in front of the shop, carwash and fuel dispensers. While this will contribute to the amenity of the site, it will not specifically address potential adverse visual amenity effects associated with the development in terms of screening or softening views of the service station. If considered safe by NZTA in terms of maintaining traffic site lines, it is recommended that taller planting is used in front of the carwash to provide useful visual mitigation to the residents of 69 Gordon Road.

The proposed acoustic fence will provide valuable visual screening from all adjoining properties, particularly in terms of screening views of vehicles visiting the site.

Conclusions

The proposed expansion will represent a noticeable increase in the size of the service station and a change in the existing site layout. It is considered that the context of the existing service station will mean that the proposed development will not have an unacceptable effect on the existing visual character of the wider surrounding area. However, due to the proposed location of the car wash and pylon sign at 70 Gordon Road, there will be some localised adverse effects on visual amenity, which are as follows:

- The proposed carwash facility opposite 69 Gordon Road, will have potential adverse visual effects associated with the movement of vehicles passing through the carwash in the direction of this property and the erosion of existing residential visual character. Proposed planting in front of the car wash is identified in the application as low growing species in order to maintain sight lines at the entrance/exit to the site. As such, it will not provide useful screening of the facility.
- Effects from 68 Gordon Road will primarily be related to the proposed location of a 9m pylon sign, approximately 16m from the northern boundary of this property. While likely to be partially screened by the proposed acoustic fence and walls of the proposed carwash, the sign is likely to be a prominent feature from locations within this property and will be in strong contrast to the pre-existing residential character of the neighbouring section.

It is recommended that the applicant consults with the owner of 70 Gordon Road regarding the provision of tall planting on the southern boundary of the site to provide visual mitigation of the pylon sign. Subject to the advice of NZTA regarding traffic sightlines, planting capable of screening views of vehicles using the carwash should also be undertaken in the garden beds in front of the carwash.

Regards,
Luke McKinlay
CITY DEVELOPMENT