

**BEFORE COMMISSIONERS ON
BEHALF OF DUNEDIN CITY COUNCIL**

IN THE MATTER of Application for Resource Consent
under Section 88 of the Resource
Management Act 1991

BY **NZ HORIZON HOSPITALITY
GROUP LIMITED**

LUC 2017-48 and SUB 2017-26

**EVIDENCE OF THOM CRAIG FOR NZ HORIZON HOSPITALITY GROUP
LIMITED**

**GALLAWAY COOK ALLAN
LAWYERS
DUNEDIN**

Solicitor on record: P J Page
Solicitor to contact: D A McLachlan
P O Box 143, Dunedin 9054
Ph: (03) 477 7312
Fax: (03) 477 5564
Email: phil.page@gallawaycookallan.co.nz
Email: derek.mclachlan@gallawaycookallan.co.nz

INTRODUCTION

1. My name is Thom Craig. Thom Craig Architects have been engaged to deliver a 5-star hotel on a 3,650m² site currently occupied by a Council car park on Moray Place.
2. I am a Director of Thom Craig Architects which was established in 2008. I have been working in the industry for over 30 years. I have a Bachelor of Architecture (University of Natal - South Africa) and a Master of Architecture (RMIT- Melbourne - Australia). I am an Associate of the New Zealand Institute of Architects ("NZIA") and a Fellow of the NZIA. I am a past chairman of the Canterbury Branch of NZIA.
3. My expertise covers a broad range of cliental, including; Central Government, Universities, Health Boards, Religious organisations, Multinationals, Private property developers, Publicly listed companies, Incorporated societies, Education boards, Entrepreneurs, Private citizens, Retailers, Restaurateurs, Hoteliers and Architectural firms.
4. My professions involvements have also included:
 - (a) Guest lecturer & Guest Examiner, Auckland University School of Architecture
 - (b) Practice director responsible for professional development and mentoring of staff architects.
 - (c) Advisor to Government on housing.
 - (d) Chair of Judging Panels - Wools of NZ Design Awards, Bathrooms & Kitchens Awards.
 - (e) Guest commentator in local media and national design magazines regarding architecture and design issues.
 - (f) Interviews on national television discussing both architectural ideas and specific buildings.
 - (g) Keynote guest speaker at NZIA national conference.
 - (h) Departmental/Faculty review of the Auckland School of Architecture.

5. I have read the Code of Conduct for Expert Witnesses within the Environment Court Consolidated Practice Note 2014 and I agree to comply with that Code. This evidence is within my area of expertise, except where I state I am relying on what I have been told by another person. To the best of my knowledge I have not omitted to consider any material facts known to me that might alter or detract from the opinions I express.

Statement of Architect's Brief

6. The proposed five star hotel, which occupies 3650m² of its CBD Site (Moray Place), is an 'Exciting and Desirable' Commercial project delivering at both an Urban Design and detailed Architectural/Structural level.

Site and its Context

7. The functional requirement for the applicant is to deliver approximately 20,000m² of floor space within a building that is evocative of its place and location, situated just off the Octagon in central Dunedin. The proposal provides a fresh modern design that compliments and enhances the surrounding buildings. The building is evocative of its place and location, and is situated just off the Octagon in central Dunedin, a city often described as the 'Edinburgh of the South'.
8. The site and its surrounding built context and topography was modelled in 3D to continuously evaluate the design massing iterations that included: articulation, pattern making, visual pathways/collage, axis, connectivity, edges, nodes and aesthetic engagement with the immediate city and its rural green backdrop.
9. The proposed 'pin-wheel solution with its 3 slender towers (further articulated to six 'finely' cut vertical slices of accommodation) is the best massing outcome and generates the smallest ground footprint and GFA required to achieve the hotel's functional needs.
10. The buildings slender tapering profile and 'tartan' tectonic detailing on a 120-degree structural set-out grid (in plan, section and elevation), coupled with its lightly tinted green glass curtain wall and 'fine/pointed/ /angular vertical lines', engages with its immediate/local surroundings

and built historical styles/context at various scales. This symmetrically compact and vertically tapering form offers an efficient structural build and minimal footprint, as well as delivering a highly modulated and elegant architectural outcome for the City.

11. The 120 degree 'pinwheel' layout of the three radial residential towers 'shielding' its central lift core, growing out of a totally landscaped/patterned site, with fully 'occupied/active' facades delivers an iconic 'botanical image' that subtly references the surrounding City and associated Green-belt (both by day and night). In my original architectural statement I described the form as that of an 'Electric Thistle.'
12. The stylistic richness of Dunedin's Edwardian and Victorian past is captured in the geometrical play of the building's surface where the 'fine grain' detailing offered by past revival styles (Gothic/Baroque/Georgian) is presented in a new contemporary architectural language that refers back to earlier commercial successes and the continuation of a Civic desire to maintain and evolve a 'memorable and distinctive' City.
13. The building's public podium forms an integral part of the structure above generating three double height landscaped garden/arbour/green wall structures recessed within the building's footprint. The podium offers its neighbours and its users a unique garden connectivity between its interior and exterior. The podium extends to its street boundary (Moray Place) where a 9-11m high semi- glazed steel structure is placed following the shape of its road boundary. This occupied structure, contains retail spaces, lighting, seating, cycle parks, and planting as it steps down the site along Moray Place towards Filleul Street. Public connectivity and the transparency of glazed street level retailing, linked to the upper level atrium and outdoor landscaped areas enhances both the visual and physical activity with the existing urban streetscape.
14. The singularity of conceptual intent of the overall building mass and form delivers an iconic three-dimensional spatial response that will resonate with the historic and existing built fabric and streetscape patterns of the City and will further enhance existing activity nodes, pathways, edges, axis, framed and distant views. The placement of the Hotel on its portion of the site is the preferred location for the slender vertical form and

would remain the preferred placement for the proposed development had we been given the 'entire site' (all of the DCC carpark land) at the start of the conceptual design stage to work with. What I wish to point out here is that the tall vertical form of the building has not been driven by the lack of land availability.

“Dominance”?

15. The issue of 'dominance' has been identified in the urban design report prepared by Garth Falconer. This connects several ideas concerning height, scale, bulk, views and shading into a single terminology. This is not standard terminology and is therefore difficult to relay into distinct elements of the design.
16. Given this considerably ambiguous term, I have addressed the issue of dominance as matter of design features and solutions which have reduced the impact on the surrounding visual /special experience of the building on a micro and macro scale.
17. I believe the design provides the best outcome at all levels that includes: a contemporary/ legacy built form that with its 'fine grain' planning and tectonic detailing will deliver a contextual outcome that's evocative of place, deliver permeable 360 degree edges to all its elevations, places car parking below grade, and offers a modern iconic building that is (generously) vertically and horizontally articulated to echo earlier historical efforts.
18. If the commercial feasibility of the project were not affected, then there is no physical reason why four floors could not be removed from the design as suggested by the reports. However I do not support that approach regardless of the economic consequences. The massing of the building has carefully considered the proportion of width to height to achieve an elegant vertical form. I believe this is important if the building is to make the best possible contribution to Dunedin's cityscape. Simply removing four floors robs the building of its elegant proportions without achieving anything of substance in return.
19. For relatively close viewing locations to the north and west, I consider that the key dimension to reduce the building's apparent mass is width, not height. For close viewers, whether a building is 9, 12 or 14 stories

above ground level (using Mr Falconer's coloured lines) is not likely to materially alter their experience of the building. At close range, viewers are likely to be more sensitive to how wide the building is. The photomontage No.4 from 96 Cargill Street is a good example of this, as is No.16 from Smith Street.

20. At more distant views, particularly elevated views, then building height becomes a more important issue. Photomontage No.6 from Moana Pool is a good example of that, as is No.8 from Rattray Street. But I consider distant viewers have a small proportion of their view altered (to use a neutral term) and I agree with Mr Falconer's assessment of distant views. For distant views, the benefits of elegant form and proportion are more important.
21. From a quality cityscape perspective, I do not support removing floors from the design. This building must make a positive contribution to the City. Once the initial shock of change has passed, Dunedin people would come to recognize that a shorter building would make an inferior contribution to the City's skyline.
22. For these reasons it would be wrong to assume that the decision not to design the tower to extend laterally to the site boundaries has lead to a tall structure to accommodate the necessary GFA. That assumption would place the design process on its head. The pinwheel tower-form is the result of a process that optimizes the required mass of the building to deliver the best hotel experience, and offers the most elegant and evocative architectural form.
23. I believe that the design offers the city of Dunedin a contemporary iconic solution that addresses, and is respectful of, the city's evolving context and heritage at both an urban design and architectural while delivering a strong confident economic statement that builds on its past.

24. The building's contemporary porosity, modulation and detailing will pursue and achieve the lineage of recent award winning buildings in Dunedin.

Thom Craig

Date: 17 July 2017