

PUBLIC TOILETS PROGRAMME - UPDATE

Department: Property

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

- 1 Dunedin City Council (DCC) owns and operates public toilets throughout Dunedin. Public toilets located within parks and recreation areas that include changing rooms are managed by Parks and Recreation, and stand-alone public toilets are managed by Property Services.
- 2 Council resolved a capex budget of \$2.05m in the 10 year plan 2021-31 to build a Changing Places bathroom, and 18 new Public Toilets (two per year) until 2031 (the 'Public Toilet Programme').
- 3 The purpose of this report is to give Council an update on progress and costs of the Public Toilet Programme since 2021, and for Council to consider whether it wishes to include \$750k in year one (2025/26) of the draft 9 year plan new capital budget for the installation of a Changing Places Bathroom.

RECOMMENDATIONS

That the Council:

- a) **Considers** whether to include a budget of \$750k in year one the 9 year plan 2025-34 new capital budget for the installation of a Changing Places Bathroom.
- b) **Notes** the Public Toilets Programme - update report.

BACKGROUND

- 4 As part of deliberations for the Annual Plan 2020/21 Council requested a public toilet report to inform the development of the 10 year plan 2021-31.
- 5 To inform the report, staff conducted a review of public toilet facilities across the city and presented an update report to Council on 14 December 2020. The review considered the condition of each public toilet, accessibility, opening hours, cleaning frequency and level of vandalism.
- 6 Staff also developed a toilet matrix ('the matrix') similar to the one used by Southland District Council to assist the prioritisation of requests for new or upgraded public toilets.
- 7 On 14 December 2020 Council resolved the following:

Moved (Cr Marie Laufiso/Cr Christine Garey):

That the Council:

- a) **Notes** that the Ten year plan 2021-31 consultation document would seek feedback on preferred locations for new public toilets to be constructed over the ten year period.
- b) **Notes** that decisions made on the capital budget option reports and the timing of those projects will be considered alongside the total capital budget and presented to the January 2021 meeting for approval.

Motion carried (CNL/2020/126)

- 8 The 10 year plan 2021-31 consultation document asked the question “Where do you think the new public toilets should go?”. 1573 submitters responded to this question, including submissions from all Community Boards.
- 9 The new locations proposed during the consultation process were evaluated using the toilet matrix and reviewed in the context of other planned projects. Attachment A demonstrates how the matrix is used, with the proposed Navy Park location as the example.
- 10 New Zealand Standard 4241:1999 (‘the Standard’) is the New Zealand Standard for Public Toilets. The standard provides design information and advice for public toilets but does not specify a set ratio of toilets to population and visitor numbers.
- 11 On 31 May 2021 Council resolved the following:

Moved (Cr Rachel Elder/Cr Steve Walker):

That the Council:

- a) **Notes** the Public Toilets and Changing Places consultation feedback on the 10 year plan 2021-31.
- b) **Approves** the proposed programme of works for new public toilet facilities, including the Changing Places bathrooms.

Motion carried (CNL/2021/097)

The 10 year plan 2021-31 capital budget included \$2.05m for new public toilets. This reflected \$250k in year one for the development of a Changing Places bathroom, and \$200k in later years for two new public toilet facilities per year. Attachment B shows the proposed locations identified at the time of the 31 May 2021 Council decision.

DISCUSSION

Procurement Process and Design

- 12 The toilet ‘design and build’ contract was tendered through an open market tender process in 2021. Three contractors responded and Permacrete was selected as the preferred provider. Permacrete represented the best ‘whole of life’ solution, with a 20-year warranty on all toilet structures, and a one-year warranty on all other finishes and workmanship within their toilets. Permacrete are the preferred toilet provider for 85% of New Zealand Councils.
- 13 Two standardised toilet designs were selected early in the planning phase so that, where appropriate, the appearance of new toilets would be consistent throughout the city. There is one design for rural areas, and another for urban areas.

- 14 The toilets are robust, vandal-resistant, low-maintenance and made from high-quality pre-cast concrete. All materials are sustainable and readily available for quick, cost-effective replacement.
- 15 Interior features include tiled walls and anti-slip floors, stainless steel hand basins, toilet pans, soap dispensers, toilet roll holders, baby changing table, and handrail. Door counters, signage, auto LED lighting (door activated), natural ventilation, cleaners tap in each cubicle with anti-tamper handle, sloping floor to stainless steel strip drain floor waste, accessible to New Zealand Standard 4121:2001.



Figure 1 and 2 - Toilet interior fixtures

- 16 Exterior features include heavy duty solid core aluminium doors painted DCC Teal Blue and are clearly labelled with English, te reo Māori and braille. The signs also indicate right or left-hand accessibility. Constructed from reinforced precast concrete. Coloursteel Maxx roofing, stainless steel gutters and downpipe, external LED security light.
- 17 The rural design (used at the new Outram Glen and Harwood Reserve sites) features a double stall with a weatherboard-style concrete finish and a gabled roof with a veranda.



Figure 3 - Outram Glen New Public Toilet

- 18 The urban design features a double stall with hardwood timber slats and a mono-pitch concrete roof. It can be found in the Exchange area, Navy Park, Tunnel Beach, and Frederick Street.



Figure 4 - Navy Park Toilet in transit

New Public Toilet Programme progress

- 19 Since 2021 a total of six new toilets have been built (shown below in the table in paragraph 24). These do not fully align with the scheduled locations presented to Council in 2021 due to challenges establishing services (water, waste, electricity/land ownership etc) on some sites, and the re-prioritisation of three new sites – Outram Glen, Signal Hill, and Tunnel Beach.
- 20 New toilet locations require various services to be established before the toilet itself can be installed. These ‘enabling works’ include things like parking, water, waste, electricity, and occasionally work to establish legal occupation of the site. The challenges and costs associated with these enabling works is the key driver of higher than budgeted costs, and delays against the original schedule.
- 21 The negotiation of Licence to Occupy, lease agreements and Letters of Authority with landowners for non-DCC owned sites, has also taken longer than the schedule anticipated. For example, obtaining the first draft Licence to Occupy document for one new toilet site took a year, and the terms are still under negotiation. A Letter of Authority from another landowner took three months to obtain.
- 22 Further, some sites have required archaeological authority, and archaeological assessments and investigations. As an example, an Archaeological Authority 2024/449 was undertaken at the Navy Park site because research had indicated that at least one pre-1900 structure had been present prior to the area being made a public park.
- 23 Planning and design work has been developed for both the Changing Places Bathroom and West Harbour Cycleway toilets. However, these projects are behind schedule due to cost escalations and complications related to the enabling works. Changing Places is discussed in more detail below and West Harbour Cycleway toilet will be the subject of a future report to Council.

- 24 The table below outlines the New Public Toilet Programme, the year scheduled for construction, location, and the current status.

Scheduled Year of Construction	Planned Location	Current Status
Year 1 2021/22	Changing Places Facility, Dunedin Railway Station area.	Paused – Council asked to consider including in the 2025/26 budget as part of this report
Year 2 2022/23	Central city, The Exchange area Harbour cycleway, St Leonards	Complete Paused – due to budget availability 2024/25 and depending on 9 year plan funding decision by Council
Year 3 2023/24	Otago Peninsula, Harwood Reserve South Dunedin, Navy Park Tunnel Beach (<i>installed in partnership with Department of Conservation</i>) Signal Hill (<i>installed in partnership with Mountain Bike Otago</i>)	Complete Complete Complete Complete
Year 4 2024/25	Outram Glen North Dunedin, close to North Ground sports ground Karitane, Truby King Reserve	Complete Scheduled for 2024/25 Paused – due to budget availability 2024/25 and depending on 9 year plan funding decision by Council
Year 5 2025/26	North Dunedin, Ross Creek area; Waitati, Doctors Point	No work commenced No work commenced
Year 6 2026/27	Green Island Memorial Park playground Central city, Princes Street Market Reserve;	No work commenced No work commenced
Year 7 2027/28	Mosgiel, Brooklands Park area Otago Peninsula, Okia Reserve	No work commenced No work commenced
Year 8 2028/29	Purakaunui Reserve Otago Peninsula, Tomahawk beach	No work commenced No work commenced
Year 9 2029/30	South Dunedin, St Kilda beach Harbour cycleway, Harbour mouth molars area	No work commenced No work commenced
Year 10 2030/31	Waldronville, Kaikorai Estuary area	No work commenced

Scheduled Year of Construction	Planned Location	Current Status
	North Dunedin, Māori Hill/Highgate area	No work commenced

- 25 In addition to the New Public Toilet Programme, Property Services maintain and renew the current public toilets. This year renewals included the complete replacement of the Frederick Street toilet.

Changing Places Bathroom

- 26 The New Public Toilet Programme currently includes a centrally located Changing Places Bathroom which was scheduled for completion in 2021/22 with an original budget of \$250k. The Changing Places Bathroom was originally planned on Moray Place next to the Dunedin Public Library and staff progressed this work through concept design stages.
- 27 Because of the nature of the Moray Place site the design would need to consider accessibility, road safety and surface water. A pedestrian crossing, landscape engineering to enable an accessible park, and stormwater water management, were included in the initial concept design.
- 28 As a result of this work, estimates were that a Changing Places bathroom at the Moray Place site, including these enabling works, would cost in the order of \$1.5 million.
- 29 Because the estimated cost was more than the budget allowed, staff considered two alternative central city sites that were likely to cost less. The first site was excluded early because the landowner declined to grant permission for the work. The second site involved replacing the existing Exeloo at the Dunedin Railway Station with a Changing Places bathroom, an accessible bathroom, and an ambulatory bathroom.
- 30 The Dunedin Railway Station site has several benefits including – is a DCC owned site, a flat site, close parking availability, existing services (water and sewerage), and the current toilets are popular with visitors and due to be upgraded.
- 31 Feedback from members of the Disability Information Advisory Group (DIAG) is in support of the Railway Station site. DIAG commented that the site was suitable due to its central location and ease of access.
- 32 While there are additional considerations for the Railway Station site, such as the heritage aspect of the area and the need for careful traffic management, staff are confident these can be addressed and worked through.
- 33 The estimated cost to install a Changing Places Bathroom on the Railway Station site is \$750k.

Costs of Public Toilets – capital and operational

Capital costs

- 34 The \$2.05m capital budget Council resolved to include in the 10 Year Plan 2021/31 was to build a Changing Places bathroom and 18 new Public Toilets (two per year) until 2031. The budget was predicated on each new public toilet costing \$200k, and \$250k for the Changing Places Bathroom.

- 35 The cost for an urban setting two-pan Permaloo toilet is \$145,962. The cost for a rural setting Permaloo toilet is \$153,860.
- 36 In addition to the toilet itself, the enabling works (such as establishing parking, water, waste, and electrical connections, negotiation of land usage agreements, and in some instances, road safety changes) have cost between \$130k and \$210k per site.
- 37 The high enabling work costs have therefore, pushed the total new public toilet costs to between \$285k and \$365k.
- 38 In the Annual Plan 2022/23 the budget for new public toilets was adjusted to \$510k per annum to better reflect the actual cost of new toilets and enabling works.

Operational costs

- 39 A plumbed public toilet costs on average \$9.5k per annum to clean, operate and maintain. A vaulted (not connected to services) public toilet costs an additional \$3.5k – \$53k per annum (dependant on the level of utilisation and location) to clean, service and empty the tanks. These costs are budgeted for in the draft 9 year plan City Properties operational budgets.
- 40 The estimated total annual operational costs for the Changing Places Bathroom are –
- | | | |
|--------------------------------------|----------------|--|
| Operating and Maintenance | \$9.5k | Based on average for plumbed public toilet |
| Depreciation | \$20.7k | |
| Interest | \$30.9k | Based on 4.12% |
| Total annual operational cost | \$61.1k | |

Current financial year 2024-2025 Public Toilet Programme

- 41 The 2024/25 capital budget for new toilets is \$510k and the new toilet programme is forecast to spend \$667k, an overspend of \$157k.
- 42 The proposed capital spend for 2024/25 is comprised of -

Outram Glen	\$362k	Completed
North Dunedin	\$305k	Scheduled
Total 2024/25 Forecast	\$667k	

- 43 The last installed new public toilet, until Council consider the new Public Toilet Programme, will be the one in North Dunedin. The unit is already purchased, and the \$157k over expenditure will be managed within the overall DCC capital expenditure budget for 2024/25.

Public toilet programme (including Changing Places Bathroom) – 9 year plan 2025-34

- 44 The draft 9 year plan 2025-34 capital budget is being considered by Council at this meeting. There is no budget included for new public toilets (including the Changing Places Bathroom) in the draft 9 year plan capital budgets.
- 45 The draft 9 year plan City Properties capital renewals budget includes \$2.3m over 9 years for the replacement and upgrade of existing public toilets.
- 46 This report provides options for Council to consider if it wishes to continue to install the Changing Places Bathroom on the Railway Station site at a cost of \$750k in the 2025/26 year. Staff confirm that if Council resolve to do this the facility could be installed in the 2025/26 year.

OPTIONS

Option One – Install a Changing Places Bathroom in 2025/26, and include a budget of \$750k in the 9 year plan 2025-34 new capital budget

Debt

- Would require borrowing of \$750k in 2025/26 (Year 1).
- The borrowing cost would be \$30.9k per annum at a rate of 4.12%, increasing to \$37.5k from 2029/30 (year 5) as the interest rate assumption changes to 5%.

Rates

- Rates funding of \$61.1k annually to 2029/30, then \$67.7k thereafter would be required to fund this option, this includes maintenance of \$9.5k, interest of \$30.9k (then \$37.5k from 2029/30) and depreciation of \$20.7k.
- Depreciation is estimated to be \$20.7k annually from year 2 of the 9 year plan.

Zero Carbon

- This option does not have material implications for city or DCC emissions.

Advantages

- Aligns with community consultation feedback as part of the 10 year plan 2021-31.
- Dunedin City would provide public toilet facilities for people with severe, multiple, or complex disabilities and their carers.

Disadvantages

- Council would have a higher debt balance and there is an upward impact on rates.

Option Two – Pause the installation of a Changing Places Bathroom

Impact assessment

Debt

- No debt funding is required for this option.

Rates

- There are no impacts on rates for this option.

Zero carbon

- This option does not have implications for city or DCC emissions.

Advantages

- Council debt is not increased and there are no impacts on rates.

Disadvantages

- Does not align with community consultation feedback as part of the 10 year plan 2021-31.
- Would mean the Dunedin City cannot provide public toilet facilities for people with severe, multiple, or complex disabilities.

NEXT STEPS

47 If Council resolve to include funding for a Changing Places Bathroom, staff will recommence planning for the Bathroom to be installed.

48 Staff will continue with the work on the Public Toilet renewals programme of work.

Signatories

Author:	Rachel Scott - Assistant Project Manager, Property Services Christian German - Capital Delivery Manager
Authoriser:	Anna Nilsen - Group Manager, Property Services Robert West - General Manager Corporate Services

Attachments

	Title	Page
A	Toilet assessment matrix example	
B	Summary of 10 year plan for Public Toilets	

SUMMARY OF CONSIDERATIONS

Fit with purpose of Local Government

This decision enables democratic local decision making and action by, and on behalf of communities.

Fit with strategic framework

	Contributes	Detracts	Not applicable
Social Wellbeing Strategy	✓	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Economic Development Strategy	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	✓
Environment Strategy	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	✓
Arts and Culture Strategy	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	✓
3 Waters Strategy	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	✓
Future Development Strategy	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	✓
Integrated Transport Strategy	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	✓
Parks and Recreation Strategy	✓	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Other strategic projects/policies/plans	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

This report contributes to the Parks and Recreation Strategy and the Social Wellbeing Strategy

Māori Impact Statement

Staff consult with iwi when locations for new public toilets facilities are identified.

Sustainability

There are no known implications for sustainability regarding this noting report.

Zero carbon

This report does not have material implications for city or DCC emissions

LTP/Annual Plan / Financial Strategy /Infrastructure Strategy

Consultation was undertaken as part of the development of the Long-Term Plan 2021-31, and budget was allocated for the new Public Toilet Programme in the Long Term Plan 2021-31 budget.

Financial considerations

The capital and operational costs of new toilets are discussed in the body of the report.

Significance

This matter is considered low in terms of Councils Significance and Engagement Policy.

Engagement – external

Consultation was undertaken as part of the development of the Long-Term Plan 2021-31, and staff consult with relevant community stakeholders when locations for new public toilets facilities are identified.

Engagement - internal

Staff consult with relevant Council staff when locations for new public toilets facilities are identified.

Risks: Legal / Health and Safety etc.

There are no identified legal risks.

SUMMARY OF CONSIDERATIONS

Conflict of Interest

There are no identified conflicts of interest.

Community Boards

Consultation was undertaken with Community Boards as part of the development of the Long-Term Plan 2021-31, and staff consult with relevant Community Boards when locations for new public toilets facilities are identified. Community Boards have raised suggestions with Council about public toilet locations and capacity as part of presentations to the Civic Committee through 2024.

TOILET ASSESMENT MATRIX EXAMPLE

Toilet Location: Navy Park

		Score 1-5	Weighting	Weighted Score	Assessor Comments	Rating System				
						1	2	3	4	5
A	Vehicular traffic	3	5	15	Main road through South Dunedin	Access Road (<100AADT)	Secondary Collector (100-300 AADT)	Primary Collector (300 - 500 AADT)	Arterial (500 - 1500)	Regional or National (>1500AADT)
B	Foot traffic	4	3	12	High foot traffic area, next to a playground.	Very low (<30 people / day)	Low (30-100 people / day)	Moderate (100-250 people / day)	High (250-1000)	Very high (>1000 people / day)
C	Typical length of stay	2	5	10	Up to an hour, next to a playground	Very short (e.g., passing by convenience store).	Up to an hour (e.g., playground, small shopping centre)	A few hours (e.g., events, picnic areas).	Day trippers	Overnight (e.g.: camping)
D	Nearest public toilet	3	2	6	Nearest public toilets at Lorne St or Marlow Park	< 200m	>200m, <1km	> 1km, < 50km	>50km, <100km	> 100km
E	Availability of other facilities (privately owned)	4	3	9	Customer only facilities, limited in the area and inconvenient	Nearby toilets always available to public.	Nearby toilets during most demand periods available to public (e.g., sports clubs).	Nearby toilets for customers only (e.g., fuel station).	Private facilities available to customers or public, 1 - 10km away.	Nearest private facility available to customers / public > 10km
F	Evidence of fouling	2	4	8	Complaints from nearby shop owners of need for public toilet	None	Rarely observed or reports from public received (< 1 per year).	Occasionally observed or reports from public received (1-2 per year).	Frequently observed or reports from public received (>3 per year).	Frequent occurrence with high visual and / or environmental impact
Total Project Weighted Score = Score x Weighting				63						

Summary of Ten Year Plan for Public Toilets 1 July 2021 – 30 June 2031

Years	Proposed programme for a changing places bathroom and new public toilet locations
Year 1 2021/2022	Moray Place beside the central library. This will be a specialist Changing Places bathroom.
Year 2 2022/2023	Central city, The Exchange area (existing toilets in Dowling Street will be removed); <i>Harbour cycleway, St Leonards*</i> ;
Year 3 2023/2024	<i>Otago Peninsula, Harwood Reserve*</i> ; South Dunedin, Navy Park;
Year 4 2024/2025	North Dunedin, close to North Ground sports ground; <i>Karitane, Truby King Reserve*</i> ;
Year 5 2025/2026	North Dunedin, Ross Creek area; <i>Waitati, Doctors Point*</i> ;
Year 6 2026/2027	<i>Green Island Memorial Park playground*</i> ; Central city, Princes Street Market Reserve;
Year 7 2027/2028	<i>Mosguel, Brooklands park area*</i> ; <i>Otago Peninsula, Okia Reserve*</i> ;
Year 8 2028/2029	<i>Purakaunui Reserve*</i> ; <i>Otago Peninsula, Tomahawk beach*</i> ;
Year 9 2029/2030	South Dunedin, St Kilda beach; Harbour cycleway, Harbour mouth molar area
Year 10 2030/2031	<i>Waldronville, Kaikorai Estuary area*</i> ; North Dunedin, Maori Hill/Highgate area;

* Indicates Community Board area