

IN THE MATTER	of the Resource Management Act 1991
AND	of an appeal under clause 14(1) of the
	First Schedule of the Act
BETWEEN	THE PRESERVATION COALITION TRUST
	(ENV-2018-CHC-285)
	Appellant
AND	DUNEDIN CITY COUNCIL
	Respondent

LANDSCAPE ASSESSMENT JWS: CORRECTION

1. The landscape architects who undertook expert witness conferencing in the above Appeal have identified an omission and an error in their statement dated 31 March 2020, as well as the need for a number of small corrections to the mapping which they wish to rectify. These are as follows:
 - A Rural Residential 1 area at Maia had not been addressed.
 - There is an error in the JWS text at paragraph 1.1b.
 - There is an error in the mapping of the boundary of the witnesses' agreed Peninsula Harbourside SNL near The Cove.
 - There is an error on some of the maps depicting the boundary between the witnesses' agreed Heyward Coast ONL and Pūrākaunui SNL in the vicinity of Pūrākaunui Stream.
 - There is an error in the mapping of the witnesses' agreed Harbour Islands and Portobello Peninsula ONF in the vicinity of the Portobello Marine Science Mapped Area.
 - There is an error on some of the maps showing an exclusion from the Heyward Coast ONL over the School zone at Pūrākaunui School.

RR1 Zone at Maia

2. A Rural Residential 1 area at Maia, which is within the scope of the appeal, was not addressed at conferencing. This RR1 zone area is located at 1 Fern Road, Maia, within the witnesses' agreed West Harbour SNL. It is directly above State Highway 88 and adjacent to General Residential 1 zoned land to the west. It is contiguous with other RR1 zoned land to the north but this land also has a Residential Transition Overlay Zone.

3. The land is steep and covered in regenerating indigenous bush and exotic trees. It is visually prominent from around the upper Otago Harbour and contributes to the natural character of the harbour landscape. Currently, it reads visually as part of a swathe of unbuilt / rural land between the suburbs of Ravensbourne / Maia and Burkes although this connectivity with other areas of rural character is likely to be weakened in the future given the Residential Transition Overlay on the land adjacent. Even so, protection of rural character and naturalness on the steeper harbourside slopes is considered valuable.
4. The witnesses agree that the unbuilt / rural character and naturalness of this visually prominent area contributes importantly to the landscape values of the west harbour and that RR 1 zoning would not adequately protect the landscape values and should be deleted.
5. Sheet 13 has been amended to include the RR1 zone at Maia (numbered 3.3.8), and is attached.

Attributes error – paragraph 1.1b

6. The witnesses wish to correct JWS para 1.1 b. by inserting the word ‘naturalness’. A corrected version of para 1.1b is appended.

Peninsula Harbourside SNL boundary near The Cove.

7. There was a mapping error on Sheets 1, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 10 and 13 in relation to the witnesses’ agreed Peninsula Harbourside SNL boundary in the vicinity of The Cove. This is now correctly shown in the attached, and is consistent with paragraph 2.2.1 of the JWS.

Heyward Coast ONL and Pūrākaunui SNL boundary in the vicinity of Pūrākaunui Stream

8. As already noted in paragraph 2.4.1 of the JWS there was a mapping error on Sheets 4, 5, 6, 7, 9, 11 and 13 in relation to the witnesses’ agreed Heyward Coast ONL and Pūrākaunui SNL boundary in the vicinity of Pūrākaunui Stream. This was correctly shown in Sheets 1 and 14 and is now corrected in the full set.

Harbour Islands and Portobello Peninsula ONF in the vicinity of the Portobello Marine Science Mapped Area.

9. There was a mapping error on Sheets 1, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11 and 13 in relation to the witnesses’ agreed Harbour Islands and Portobello Peninsula ONF boundary in the vicinity of the Portobello Marine Science Mapped Area. As noted in

paragraph 2.3.1 of the JWS, the Portobello Marine Science Mapped Area should have been excluded from the ONF overlay. This is correctly shown in the attached set.

Heyward Coast ONL at Pūrākaunui School

10. There was a mapping error on Sheets 1, 4, 6, 7, 9, 11 and 13 excluding the school zone at Pūrākaunui School from the witnesses agreed Heyward Coast ONL, described in paragraph 2.4.1 of the JWS. The Heyward Coast ONL overlay is now correctly shown, covering the school zone on the attached map set.

Corrected Maps

11. A set of corrected maps (Sheets 1 – 14) is attached. Please note that notwithstanding any detailed mapping inaccuracies at present, where not adjacent to Township and Settlement zones, the ONF, ONL and SNL boundary lines are intended to meet the Coastal Marine Area boundary around the coast.
12. Sheets 15 and 16 are now also included. These are maps prepared by Dunedin City Council to help highlight the recommended JWS changes to the current 2GP overlays and zoning.

Date: 25 May 2020



Di Lucas



Mike Moore

Appendix: JWS paragraph 1.1b - corrected version

1. Methodology used by witnesses for assessment of ONL, ONF and SNL

1.1 The Attributes to be Used

The 2GP is to implement the Otago proposed RPS. The witnesses are agreed that the factors (variously called values and criteria) to be used for the assessment of ONL in the 2GP do not align in all regards with the corresponding factors in the Otago proposed RPS. Copies of the relevant provisions from the respective instruments are attached as Appendix 1 and 2 (2GP policy 2.4.4.1. and Otago pRPS Schedule 3). Relevant differences between the two instruments are:

- a. pRPS groups factors/criteria under biophysical, sensory and associative attributes
- b. The 2GP does not group them in this way, and omits the presence of water, vegetation, naturalness, and, wild or scenic.

In order to provide a comprehensive list of assessment factors the witnesses have adopted the proposed RPS factors at Appendix 2 but with expanded factors to recognise a bi-cultural lens, such as at paragraph 1a and 2b, and substituting 'aesthetic' for 'amenity' values at 2b, recognising that "aesthetic" references all senses - sound, smell, sight, feel, movement and memory). The assessment factors agreed and applied by the witnesses are therefore as follows with changes from the pRPS underlined:

1. Biophysical attributes

- a. Natural science factors, including geological, topographical, ecological and dynamic components, and as mātauraka Māori
- b. The presence of water including in seas, lakes, rivers and streams
- c. Vegetation (native and exotic)

2. Sensory attributes

- a. Legibility or expressiveness – how obviously the feature or landscape demonstrates its formative processes
- b. Aesthetic values including memorability (pupuri), and naturalness.
- c. Transient values including presence of wildlife or other values at certain times of the day, night, season or year
- d. Wild or scenic values.

3. Associative attributes

- a. Whether the values are shared and recognised
- b. Cultural and spiritual values for Kāi Tahu, identified by working as far as practicable, in accordance with tikanga Māori, including their expression as cultural landscapes and features
- c. Historical and heritage associations

Rather than a traditional Euro-centric bias, the witnesses agree that bi-cultural relationships with natural landscapes should be recognised with regard to all attributes, thus Māori values should not be confined to consideration as a single associative attribute for Manawhenua. As defined in the 2GP, we recognise wāhi tupuna are “Landscapes and sites that embody the ancestral, spiritual and religious traditions of all the generations prior to European settlement”. We agree that further liaison by Dunedin City Council with rūnaka as kaitiakitaka is appropriate to refine the landscape descriptions, attributes and values articulated in this JWS.

The witnesses are agreed that the above assessment factors cover those in the NZCPS Policy 15. The witnesses note that several base studies, including Boffa Miskell 2007, pre-date the NZCPS or did not assess this range of attributes, including Moore 2013, and that a 2020 re-assessment as provided in this JWS is appropriate.