

**HERITAGE ASSESSMENT FOR SCHEDULED HERITAGE BUILDING:
FRAEMONT AT 163 CARROLL STREET**



Google Streetview (2019)

PROPERTY INFORMATION

Temporary 2GP Scheduled Heritage Building Reference No	BX063
Address	163 Carroll Street
Located within a Heritage Precinct	No
HNZPT List Reference & Description	N/A
Heritage Covenant:	No
Building Use at Time of Record	Residential
Condition of Property:	Not known to be at risk because of condition

SUMMARY OF HERITAGE SIGNIFICANCE ASSESSMENT

Historic/Social	Meets criteria
Spiritual/Cultural	Does not meet criteria
Design	Meets criteria
Technological/Scientific	Does not meet criteria

RECOMMENDATION:

The building meets one or more of the significance criteria from Policy 2.4.2.1.b and is recommended for inclusion in Appendix A1.1 of the 2GP.

RECOMMENDED PROTECTION

[Tick]	Features	Details
✓	Building envelope	Entire external building envelope
✓	External/ancillary elements	Stone and brick wall to Melville and Carroll Streets
	Internal elements and/or rooms	Not considered as part of this desktop assessment. Owner may nominate interior elements for protection
	Excluded elements	

STATEMENT OF SIGNIFICANCE

Fraemont, at 163 Carroll Street, has historic and design significance as a late Victorian Italianate gentleman's residence designed by architect JL Salmond for prominent Dunedin businessman Arthur Sidey. The dwelling demonstrates the varied social and cultural history of the Fernhill area during the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries; development from this period comprised both substantial residences and dense working-class housing. The c1900 dwelling is located on a prominent corner site and retains a good level of authenticity and integrity.

Fraemont is comparable to scheduled heritage buildings within Dunedin of a similar type and period. When compared with other scheduled buildings, it meets the threshold to be included on the district plan heritage schedule.

HISTORICAL SUMMARY

Architectural Period	Victorian (1838-1901)
Style	Italianate Villa
Era/Date of Construction	1900
Architect/Designer/Builder	Attributed to JL Salmond
Historic Use & Cultural Associations	Sidey family residence
Construction Materials	Face brick, plaster detailing, slate roofing, timber door and window joinery, leadlighting.
Architectural Features	Two storey bay villa with verandah, projecting bays, quoins and contrasting plaster work, corbelled eaves, hipped roof.

Previous site development

Section 22 Block IV on which the Sidey residence is built was originally part of a larger block owned by John Jones (or his estate) from the 1860s until 1880. Walter Guthrie owned the land in the 1880s and 1890s, at which time 2 substantial 'gentlemen's residences' and associated structures such as coach houses and stables were built. The sections fronting Walker (now Carroll) and Melville Streets were offered for sale in 1899.¹ The land was cleared in the early 1940s.

¹ Deed Index C82; Deed Index T288. Sale Notice *Evening Star*, 7 Feb 1899, p. 3.

Design and construction

Sidey purchased the land in 1900. In March 1900, architect JL Salmond invited tenders for a brick residence on the corner of Melville and Walker Streets. Sources at Hocken Collections indicate this is the subject residence. The contractors were Hilton and Miles. Sidey named the house Fraemont.²

Fraemont is a two-storey brick Italianate return corner bay villa with a slate roof. It has an asymmetrical form, with decorative elements including paired eave brackets, contrasting quoins, and faceted bay windows. The house has an enclosed verandah on the first-floor elevation, flat arch headed windows, as well as stained glass in the main entrance windows. The house has a stone retaining wall topped with a brick garden wall to Melville Street, and a stepped brick wall to Carroll Street that are notable features of the property.

Later history and development

Fraemont remained in the Sidey family ownership until the 1970s. The house remains a private residence.



Fraemont, partially obscured at the left, in 1970 after the clearance of substandard housing along Melville Street. Source DCC Archives

Notable people/Themes

History of the Fernhill area

The triangle of land from High Street, Maitland, Princes Street has a rich and varied social and cultural history, of importance to the development of Dunedin; It has a substantial number of Victorian and Edwardian residential buildings. Buildings from these eras include workers cottages, small villas, terraces, bungalows, and grand residences. They represent what has been successive rebuilding of an historic quarter of the city that once provided temporary (tents and shacks) and semi-permanent accommodation for people during the 1860s' gold rushes.³

² *Otago Daily Times*, 8 Mar 1900, p. 1.; DM pers comm.

³ Manor Place SCA Assessment 2012 DRAFT

The Carroll (formerly Walker) Street area was dubbed the 'devil's half acre' and 'outcast Dunedin' in the nineteenth century.⁴ The nearby area around Palmyra was subject to 'slum clearances' in the 1960s and 1970s. The area surrounding the Cairn's Buildings has lost much of the small-scale nineteenth century housing that represented its early development in a particularly dense manner.

Fraemont is one of several grand houses of former leading citizens that are of special note. Originally built on larger lots (since subdivided), they were designed by the best of Dunedin's architects to take advantage of prevailing sun angles and views. A small cluster to Melville St, near to what is now the Dunedin Club, are sited on lots originally purchased by members of the Cargill family, from the Jones family who lived at Fernhill (Dunedin Club). The houses, mostly dating from the late 1860s to the turn of the twentieth century, are striking for their size, form, and articulation.⁵

Arthur Murray Sidey (and Sidey family)

Arthur Sidey was the son of John Sidey, one of Dunedin's most prominent Pākehā settlers. Educated at Otago Boy's High School, he was employed by the National Bank in Dunedin, before being transferred to Napier. He returned to Dunedin around 1897 after his marriage to Ella Hall, where he set up on his own account as a sharebroker. He was a member of the Dunedin Stock Exchange for over 40 years. He was associated with the directorate of several Dunedin firms, as well as of the Provident Life Assurance Company and the Yorkshire Insurance Company. He was active in sporting circles, being a member of the Kaituna Bowling Club, the Hunt Club, and the Dunedin Jockey Club.⁶

MARRIAGE.

SIDEY—HALL.—On the 17th February, at St. John's Cathedral, Napier, by the Very Rev. the Dean of Waiapu, Arthur Murray, son of John Sidey, of Corstorphine, Dunedin, to Clara Helena (Ella) Hall, second daughter of John M. Hall, of Auburn, Pirongia, and niece of Captain Davidson, of Napier.

Announcement of Arthur Sideys marriage to Ella Hall in 1897; Source: Otago Daily Times, Issue 10732, 22 February 1897, Page 2

⁴ James Veitch and Dalia Tinawi, 'Middle Eastern peoples - Assimilation and recent arrivals', Te Ara - the Encyclopedia of New Zealand, <http://www.TeAra.govt.nz/mi/document/2019/attack-in-walker-street> (accessed 7 August 2024)

⁵ Manor Place SCA Assessment 2012 DRAFT

⁶ Obituary, *Otago Daily Times*, 10 Aug 1940, p. 12.

JL Salmond

Hardwicke Knight records that Salmond was born in England, son of Rev. Dr William Salmond who came to Dunedin to take up the position of Professor of Mental and Moral Philosophy at Otago University.

Built in Dunedin's summary of J L Salmond's life and career is reproduced in edited form below:

J. Louis Salmond established his practice in Dunedin in 1891, in the difficult years of the Long Depression. He had been an articled pupil of Robert Arthur Lawson, who left Dunedin in 1889. After Lawson returned from Australia in 1900 the two men went into partnership as Salmond & Lawson. Early works by Salmond include the Shennan family home "Threave" in High St, and the Roslyn Presbyterian Church.

Lawson died in 1902 and Salmond subsequently went into practice with Newton Vanes, who served in World War 1 and afterwards remained in England.

ASSESSMENT OF HERITAGE SIGNIFICANCE

HISTORIC/SOCIAL

The dwelling demonstrates heritage values within this criterion. Fraemont has historical significance for its association with Arthur Sidey and the Sidey family. The Sideys were a significant settler family in nineteenth century Dunedin. Arthur was involved in significant business and social circles in the city. The dwelling represents the historic development of the area, as an enclave containing both grand residences associated with some of Dunedin's significant and wealthy families (of whom the Sideys were one) alongside dense working-class housing that was subject to widespread clearance in the latter half of the twentieth century.

SPIRITUAL/CULTURAL

The building does not demonstrate heritage values within this criterion.

DESIGN

The dwelling demonstrates heritage values within this criterion. Fraemont has significance as an Italianate Victorian gentleman's residence designed by significant Dunedin architect JL Salmond. It is a grand residence occupying a prominent corner site making a significant aesthetic contribution to the streetscape. The c1900 dwelling retains a good level of authenticity and integrity.

TECHNOLOGICAL/SCIENTIFIC

The building does not demonstrate heritage values within this criterion.

REFERENCES

Deed Index C82; Deed Index T288.

Sale Notice *Evening Star*, 7 Feb 1899, p. 3.
Obituary, *Otago Daily Times*, 10 Aug 1940, p. 12.
DCC Archives
Otago Daily Times, 8 Mar 1900, p. 1.
Otago Daily Times, Issue 10732, 22 February 1897, p. 2

Date Assessment Completed	11 May 2023	Author	HB
Date Peer Reviewed	7 August 2024	Reviewer	MM
Date Confirmed Complete	8 August 2024		

APPENDIX

Research notes in nominations file: titles and deed index entries.

DRAFT