

HERITAGE ASSESSMENT FOR SCHEDULED HERITAGE BUILDING:
38 BELGRAVE CRESCENT - BRYNDWYLT



Image: Origin Consultants

PROPERTY INFORMATION

Temporary 2GP Scheduled Heritage Building Reference No:	BX045
Address:	38 Belgrave Crescent, Dunedin
Located within a Heritage Precinct:	No
HNZPT List Reference & Description:	N/A
Heritage Covenant:	No
Building Use at Time of Record:	Residential
Condition of Property:	Not known to be at risk because of condition

SUMMARY OF HERITAGE SIGNIFICANCE ASSESSMENT

Historic/Social	Meets criteria
Spiritual/Cultural	Does not meet criteria
Design	Meets criteria
Technological/Scientific	Does not meet criteria

RECOMMENDATION:

The building meets one or more of the significance criteria from Policy 2.4.2.1.b and is recommended for inclusion in Appendix A1.1 in the 2GP.

RECOMMENDED PROTECTION

[Tick]	Features	Details
✓	Building envelope	Entire external building envelope
	External/ancillary elements	
	Internal elements and/or rooms	Not considered as part of this desktop assessment. Owner may nominate interior elements for protection
	Excluded elements	

STATEMENT OF SIGNIFICANCE

Bryndwylt, a gentleman's residence designed by pioneering and significant Dunedin architect NYA Wales as his own residence, has historic and design significance. As Wales' home for some thirty years, and as home for prominent businessman Sir John Sutherland Ross, it provides insight into the lifestyle of the city's elite. Although the form of Wales' original design has been obscured by the later additions, the building retains architectural significance illustrating the progression of changes in what is an 'interesting and eclectic mansion.'

Bryndwylt is comparable to scheduled heritage buildings within Dunedin of a similar period and function. When compared with other scheduled buildings, it meets the threshold to be included on the district plan heritage schedule.

HISTORICAL SUMMARY

Architectural Period	Victorian (1838-1901) Interwar (1918-1945)
Style	Victorian/Interwar
Era/Date of Construction	Original construction c.1868-1876
Architect/Designer/Builder	NYA Wales (original house) [Attributed to Mandeno and Fraser] (alterations and additions 1920s – unlabelled as to architect but a similar hand to the 1930s plans) Mandeno and Fraser (additions 1930s)
Historic Use & Cultural Associations	Residential
Primary Construction Materials	Masonry, plaster, slate roofing, timber and steel window joinery, shingles.
Notable Architectural Characteristics	Mansard roof, eclectic combination of forms, dormer windows, wrap around verandah, timber and steel-framed window joinery, leadlight glazing.

Brief History

The text below is reproduced from '38 Belgrave Street External Condition Report Jan 2022' by Origin Consultants.

The house at 38 Belgrave Crescent is situated on part of Section 9, Block IV, Upper Kaikorai District. It is said to have been designed and constructed by Nathaniel Young Armstrong Wales, from rock reportedly quarried on site, and was originally named 'Bryndwylt.' Wales purchased the land in July 1868. A mortgage was taken out over the land in November 1871 and again in December 1876.



Bryndwylt as constructed by NYA Wales circa 1870 (Hocken Collections)

NYA Wales was born in Northumberland, England and was educated at Jedburgh, Scotland. He emigrated to New Zealand, via Australia, arriving in Dunedin circa 1863. He initially worked as a Clerk of Works for the architect William Mason on the old Bank of New Zealand Building (1862-1864), the Post Office Building (1864-1868), and the Port Chalmers Graving Dock (1868-1872). He then began to work on his own as an untrained architect, and asked Mason to return from retirement to enter into partnership in 1871. Their firm Mason & Wales was responsible for many buildings in Dunedin, including Bishops court (1873), St Matthew's Church (1873), the Government Life Insurance Building (1897), and Wains Hotel (1878). Wales was later a Member of Parliament, occupied a seat on the Dunedin Harbour Board, and was a Dunedin City councillor, and the mayor for a year (1895-96).

Wales died in 1902. Ann Black Paterson (nee Brown) bought the mansion for £2,400. Ann Paterson (also known as Annie) was born Ann Black Brown on 18 March 1846. The Black Brown's emigrated to New Zealand with their six children in 1858 from Kilbarchan, Renfrewshire. Daniel Brown built a house in Roslyn in 1858, which was constructed out of prefabricated pieces shipped from Australia. This house, at 8 Lundie Street is now the earliest surviving dwelling in Roslyn.

Daniel Brown was a dairy farmer with a Crown Grant of 30 acres, from Highgate to Kaikorai Valley.

Ann married Captain John Paterson in Roslyn in 1870. Paterson was a Master Mariner, who was born in Scotland in 1842 and emigrated to New Zealand circa 1869. Brown transferred a parcel of land to Ann, and she built the house at 115 Highgate on it. Between 1871 and 1886, the Paterson's had four daughters and three sons. Ann appears to have been a shrewd businesswoman, leasing land with a house and two shops in Roslyn and 115 Highgate after the family moved to the Bryndwylt mansion. Captain Paterson died in 1914, aged 72, and Ann died in 1922, aged 75. Their daughter, Florence, inherited 115 Highgate. The flagpole and ship hatch cover over the stairway to the roof are thought to be an addition from Captain Paterson's occupation of Bryndwylt.

In the 1920s, the house was purchased by Sir John Sutherland Ross, a prominent Dunedin businessman and chairman of the director of the New Zealand and South Seas International Exhibition. The mansion became known as 'Broomhill.' Ross made various alterations to the mansion in the 1920s, including the addition of a two-storey wing to the original structure and removal of the conservatory. He also added a verandah to the second storey, with the windows altered to open out onto the verandah and extended the dining room and night nursery. Under Ross' ownership, the house hosted many events and sported a full-size billiards table, a gun room, and a gents' cloak room. The latter had white tiled walls, a mosaic floor, antique toilet, and master suite above. The master suite had an ensuite and dressing room. The Ross family also extended the drawing room, by taking out the bay window to extend the room a few feet, for large scale entertaining. The house was connected to the Dunedin drainage and sewerage system in 1922. In 1935, Ross added further rooms to the north-west corner of the ground floor and a bathroom into the first floor.

In 1881, Dunedin's first cable car opened running towards Roslyn from the city. The line initially stopped at the Town Belt but was later extended to climb the full length of Ross Street and part of Belgrave Crescent. In 1902, the service was taken over by the Dunedin and Roslyn Tramway Company Ltd, of which Ross was a director. The last car ran on 25 October 1951. When the line closed, the section above Belgrave Crescent was too steep to form a road link and it was redeveloped as a short street.

The house was then carved into flats, but when it was purchased by John and Jill Blennerhassett in the 1960s, they converted it back into a family home. In 1972, the Blennerhassett's also remodelled the kitchen with a large angular breakfast bar dominating the centre of the room. A new stove and workspace were installed in the location of the original coal range. A 'Chinaman rock' collected from Waitahuna was incorporated into the cooking recess and in the new fire surround in the den at the front of the house. The ceiling was lowered, and a new aluminium window was installed above the work bench. The carport to the south-west of the house was converted into a garage in 1972.

Two staircases remained at the property when inspected by Lois Galer – a grand staircase for the gentry and a narrow staircase for the servants. The latter spirals up to the roof hatch, which provides access to the roof. In the basement, there is a strong room with a 5cm thick door. In the garden, there is a well almost 40 feet deep.

In 1988, alterations were carried out at the property involving the removal of a double brick wall to extend the windows at a cost of \$6,200.20 No further details are recorded. In 1994, the outhouse on the western elevation was demolished and replaced with French doors and aluminium infill panels. At that time, bluestone walling and roughcast over brick was recorded on the western elevation.

Physical Description

The mansion at 38 Belgrave Crescent was original built for the architect, NYA Wales, in about 1870. Since that time, it has undergone a variety of changes and additions, including the construction of the two-storey south wing and west wing in the 1920s. Other modifications include the addition of a balcony/verandah; the removal of a conservatory, outhouse, and decorative roof brattishing; additional rooms, extensions and the modification most windows and doors. The original architecture of the Bluestone and mansard slate roof house has been diminished by these changes and there are now many complicated and, in places, awkward details resulting from the additions.

For ease of identification in this report, the house is split into three broad parts as follows:

- 1. The original part, which includes the later verandah/balcony;*
- 2. The two-storey south wing; and*
- 3. The two-storey west wing with the single-storey kitchen extension.*

Part 1

The historical images indicate that the mansion had two large, brick chimneys to the main roof (these remain in modified form) and at least another to the single-storey part of the building.

The main roof was flat or shallow-pitched originally it had a lead sheet cladding and no guttering. An image shows the edge of a corrugated iron sheet roof cladding and an ogee pattern iron or steel gutter below it. The difference in dates when these images were taken is unknown, but it is quite possible that alterations were made fairly early in the life of the building. In both images, the roof edge was finished with an ornamental barrier or brattishing.

A 1921 architectural drawing seems to show the main roof as having a steeper pitch then, but this may be a drafting error. The access structure (ship hatch cover) leading to the roof is quirky and the historical narrative suggests it is the work of Captain Paterson's, who lived at the house in the period c.1902-1914.

Below this upper roof structure, the first-floor accommodation was constructed within a mansard roof clad with vertically hung, rectangular slates above and below a horizontal strip of fish-scale slates. The hips seem to have been clad with lead sheeting and had a decorative motif under the upper eaves. The first-floor windows were formed by dormers with small flat roofs also finished with brattishing and with decorative sills. Although modified, the form of these dormer windows seems to remain in two existing windows within the section of mansard roof to the south elevation. The windows themselves originally seem to have been timber sliding sashes.

The ground floor of the building was built of masonry construction finished externally with rusticated Bluestone blocks. The door and window surrounds and the quoins to the elevations were expressed in a lighter colour, probably a limewash. Again, the windows themselves seem to have been timber sliding sashes.

The existing leaded light windows, including those developed into small projecting bays, seem to be commensurate in age with the alterations and extensions that were added in the 1920s (Dunedin City Council archive record dated 1921 comprising architectural design drawings [unnamed architect, but prepared for Mr. Ross]). The verandah and balcony are also present on these drawings, together with another two tall chimneys. North elevation extensions date from c.1924 and c.1936.

Part 2

This is the two-storey south wing dating from the 1920s. The drawings in the DCC archive record above suggest that it is built of cavity brick walls. Externally, these walls are cement rough cast rendered and painted. The main roof is of hipped design with sprocketed slopes clad with natural slates.

The windows comprise leaded lights in steel frames and timber sub-frames (some now modified with later units).

Part 3

This is the single-storey service range from the c.1870 mansion that had a second storey added in the 1920s and a single-storey extension (that is now the kitchen). The north end of the two-storey wing was extended in the 1930s (Mandeno & Fraser drawing for J. Sutherland Ross dated November 1935 in the DCC archives).

The architectural drawings suggest the ground floor is of solid masonry construction, faced with Bluestone, whilst the first floor is built of cavity brickwork, rough cast rendered externally. The Mandeno & Fraser extension is also indicated as being of rendered cavity brick construction.

The roof of the two-storey wing is hipped and clad with natural slates. There is a similar slate clad roof to the single-storey extension, but with some diamond-pattern slating. Fish-scale slates present on the east slope of the two-storey wing suggest they may have been re-purposed from the original house mansard roof.

ASSESSMENT OF HERITAGE SIGNIFICANCE

HISTORIC/SOCIAL

The dwelling demonstrates heritage values within this criterion. Bryndwylt has historical significance for as the home for nearly 30 years of early and significant Dunedin architect Nathaniel Young Armstrong Wales, partner in Dunedin's oldest architectural firm Mason and Wales. Wales had arrived in Dunedin in 1863, originally working a Clerk of Works for architect William Mason, before establishing Mason and Wales in 1871. The house also has strong association with the Paterson family, and with Sir John

Sutherland Ross, a prominent Dunedin businessman and chair of the directors of the New Zealand and South Seas International Exhibition.

SPIRITUAL/CULTURAL

The building does not demonstrate heritage values within this criterion.

DESIGN

The dwelling demonstrates heritage values within this criterion. The significance assessment from the External Condition Report is reproduced below:

'This is an eclectic and interesting historic mansion. In essence, it comprises the core of the 1870s mansion of NYA Wales, the substantial development of the 1920s, and the extension of Mandeno & Fraser in the latter half of the 1930s. The highly decorative and individual nature of Wales' mansion has been lost, but its essential architectural form can still be discerned in places. Whilst the later changes to this mansion may not have the heritage significance of the original structure, they are still worthy of recognition... as successive layers of history.'

TECHNOLOGICAL/SCIENTIFIC

The building does not demonstrate heritage values within this criterion.

REFERENCES

Origin Consultants Ltd, '38 Belgrave Street External Condition Report Jan 2022.'

Date Assessment Completed	7 October 2022 (abridged from Origin Consultant's assessment report)	Author	HB
Date Peer Reviewed	21 June 2024	Reviewer	MM
Date Confirmed Complete	24 July 2024		