

**HERITAGE ASSESSMENT FOR SCHEDULED HERITAGE BUILDING:
FORMER ANDERSONS BAY PRESBYTERIAN CHURCH AT 76 SILVERTON STREET**



Heritage New Zealand Pouhere Taonga image

PROPERTY INFORMATION

Temporary 2GP Scheduled Heritage Building Reference No:	BX001
Address:	76 Silvertown Street, Andersons Bay, Dunedin
Other Building Name:	N/A
Located within a Heritage Precinct:	No
HNZPT List Reference:	List No. 9695, Category 2 historic place
Heritage Covenant:	No
Building Use at Time of Record:	LUC granted for residential development 2022
Condition of Property:	Earthquake Prone Building Register No. 2304

SUMMARY OF HERITAGE SIGNIFICANCE ASSESSMENT

Historic/Social	Meets criteria
Spiritual/Cultural	Meets criteria
Design	Meets criteria
Technological/Scientific	Does not meet criteria

RECOMMENDATION:

The building meets one or more of the significance criteria from Policy 2.4.2.1.b and is recommended for inclusion in Appendix A1.1 of the 2GP.

RECOMMENDED PROTECTION

[Tick]	Features	Details
✓	Building envelope	Entire external building envelope excluding the adjacent hall.
	External/ancillary elements	
	Internal elements and/or rooms	Not considered as part of this desktop assessment. Owner may nominate interior elements for protection
✓	Excluded elements	Hall/Former Kindergarten – approved for demolition

STATEMENT OF SIGNIFICANCE

Heritage New Zealand Pouhere Taonga's summary statement is reproduced below:

'Built in 1914, to a design by Dunedin architect Edward Walden, Andersons Bay Presbyterian Church is historically significant as it represents the establishment of suburban churches in Dunedin in the 1860s. The parish was one of the earliest established in Dunedin outside First Church and reflects the importance and growth of the Free Church of Scotland settlement. Its subsequent growth and decline represent the history of Presbyterianism in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries. The church has aesthetic significance as a local landmark on a prominent corner site and is also of architectural and spiritual value.'

The former Andersons Bay Presbyterian Church is comparable to scheduled heritage buildings within Dunedin of a similar function and period. When compared with other scheduled buildings, the former church meets the threshold to be included on the district plan heritage schedule.

HISTORICAL SUMMARY

Architectural Period	Edwardian
Style	Gothic Revival
Era/Date of Construction	1914
Architect/Designer/Builder	Edward Walden (architect) Joseph Eli White (contractor)
Historic Use & Cultural Associations	Church
Primary Construction Materials	Masonry, slate, timber
Notable Architectural Characteristics	Gothic Revival detailing, stained glass windows.

HISTORY

Heritage New Zealand Pouhere Taonga's List Entry text is reproduced below:

Kāti Mamoe-Kāi Tahu had several landing places in the Otago harbour at the time of colonial settlement of the Otago region. Māori named this area Puketahi (also known as Puketai) for the single hill that dominates the landscape of this area. A trail led through the sandhills at St Clair and Tomahawk to Sandfly Bay and Hoopers Inlet and then to the kaik. Māori from Ōtākou traded fish and potatoes with settlers at Puketai.

The first European settler was James Anderson, who came from Nelson to Port Chalmers in December 1844. The area was subdivided into suburban allotments of ten acres in the late 1840s. Andersons Bay was isolated – in the 1850s travellers had to take a boat or make a long sweep via St Clair. The area was connected to the city by rail from 1877, but the area was not in demand for residential settlement. The first clusters of housing grew up around Silverton Street, Shiel Hill, Sunshine and Tainui once the electric tram service began in 1907.

The early Presbyterian settlers attended First Church. Local historian Henry Duckworth writes that '[i]t was not easy to get over the swamp road as it was called, and it is a well-known fact that some of the women travelled barefoot through the mud, carrying their boots and stockings in their hands, and that, before going into church, washed their feet at a spring prior to putting on their stockings and boots again.' Reverend Thomas Burns used to make fortnightly visits to Andersons Bay to conduct services and prayer meetings.

The first local Presbyterian services in Andersons Bay were held at the school in 1863, with Reverend James McNaughton answering the call and inducted into the charge in July 1863. Robert Arthur Lawson designed a timber church, the second Dunedin church. The 200-seat church opened in March 1864, the service conducted by Reverend Thomas Burns. Anglicans built their own church in Dunedin in 1874, with the Methodist, Baptist and Catholic churches also building places of worship.

Lawson's timber church was enlarged in the early 1880s with the addition of two transepts, making it cruciform in plan, designed by architects Oakden and Begg.

Andersons Bay parish celebrated its jubilee in 1913, passing a resolution to build a new church, as part of the celebrations. Architect E.W. Walden's plans were approved by the Presbytery and in February 1914, Walden called for tenders. The tender of Joseph Eli White was chosen from the seventeen tenderers. The 480-seat brick church was built by White to a cost of £3532. The original plans allowed for a spire, but this was never built. Two foundation stones were laid on 6 May 1914 (one by Mrs Cameron, wife of the then minister, and the other by five of the pioneer women members of the congregation), and the building opened with much celebration on 6 December 1914.

The new church incorporated two memorial windows transferred from the old timber church: the Somerville Memorial Window (in memory of William Somerville (1900)), and the Holmes Window depicting Matthew, Mark, Luke and John (in memory of the Hon. Matthew Holmes (1899)).

The church became an Andersons Bay landmark. Local historian Henry Duckworth, writing in 1923, states that the church ‘...stands in a noble position, at the junction of five roads, overlooking White Island in one direction and the greenest of green valleys in the other. A more romantic situation could not be wished for....Everybody concerned seems to be pleased with the look of the new building, and passers-by admire it. The burning bush over the doorway declares the denomination, and the general appearance of the front is in agreement with the symbol, the design being characterised by a suggestion of sturdiness and resoluteness which fits in with one’s ideas about Presbyterianism. The square louvered tower strengthens the plan, and the architectural details nicely break up the design and save it from anything in the way of uncompromising utility. It is, in fact, a beautiful church as viewed from the exterior. ’

Inside the church, Duckworth commented that ‘...everything satisfies the eye. The walls are of white granite plaster, the ceiling and the fittings of oiled red pine. Plenty of light is admitted, and special pains have been taken to perfect the ventilation and the heating arrangements.’ An organ was located behind the pulpit, and there were plans to add a gallery that would provide access to the tower. When the church was opened, the bells were still to be installed, awaiting sufficient funds. There was ample space for the vestry and classrooms, and a large basement hall. Sunday School was held in the old church. The church had electric lighting.

The brick Sunday School and social hall was built in 1924. The Somerville Room, a lounge, links the church and the adjacent kindergarten (former parish centre). The south wall of the church was plastered in 1924 to provide weather proofing when the ‘sand bricks’ used in the basement wall failed and let in the damp. In 1926, the ‘whole front’ of the church was ‘rearranged’. The pulpit and choir seats were moved, and oak panelling added as an organ screen. Two further memorial windows were added to the church in the late 1920s/early 1930s; in 1928 the Cameron window was added in memory of Dr Andrew Cameron who died in 1925, and in 1930 the Whyte window was added, a memorial to John Whyte who died in 1925.

In 1953, in celebration of the ninetieth anniversary, a memorial window located behind the communion table was dedicated. This window was in memory of the pioneers who established the church. In 1954 a new bell was dedicated.

In 1963, the centenary of the induction of the first minister was celebrated with the publication of a small booklet. The author considered that the church ‘stands sturdily as a tribute to the initiative of the congregations of half a century ago’, and to those who continue to maintain the building. In 1965 the cornice parapets and pinnacles on top of the bell tower were removed as they were judged to be unsafe. A second booklet recounting the church’s history was published in June 1988, to celebrate the 125th jubilee.

The church’s status as a local landmark was again recognised in 2000, when historian Ron Tyrrell described the church as ‘the district’s most prominent building, exemplifying permanence and resolution.’ The church remained in use throughout the 2000s, but its congregation was declining. Late in 2014, the church was found to be earthquake prone. The parish, already diminished, did not have the funds to repair the building and bring it up to standard, and there were discussions about its future. In 2015, the Southern Presbytery approved the dissolution of the Andersons Bay parish. The last service was held in April 2015, and the parish ceased to exist on 24 April 2015. The governance of the building passed to the Southern Presbytery and the

Synod of Otago and Southland. In 2016, the future of the former Andersons Bay Presbyterian Church remains undecided.

PHYSICAL DESCRIPTION

Setting

Andersons Bay Presbyterian Church is located in the southern suburb of Andersons Bay. This suburb is located at the southern end of the peninsula, overlooking St Kilda beach and South Dunedin. The church sits on a prominent corner site at the meeting of several streets and is regarded as a local landmark. It is opposite what was the tram terminus and sits across the road from the local shops. The surrounding buildings are houses, largely single residences on well planted sections. The church has a view over Andersons Bay Inlet and in the distance, the city. Alongside the church is the former parish centre, now used as a kindergarten.

Exterior

The brick church is built over two levels – a basement below road level housing meeting rooms, and at street level, the nave, offices and kitchen. The main entrance faces Silverton Street through a gabled porch. The church is Gothic in style, with a square tower. The lancet windows have contrasting facings, with the horizontal banding providing the major decorative element of the facade. The nave has gabled ventilators in the roof, with notional transepts provided by gables halfway down the nave. A bridge provides access from Spottiswoode Street to the rooms at the rear of the nave. In later years, the turret was removed, and the current tower has a truncated appearance. The south wall has been plastered because of concerns about weathering.

Interior

The main body of the church at street level is approached through a porch and lobby from Silverton Street. To the right of the lobby is the former minister's office, notable for its two lancet windows with quarry panes. The joinery is also of note, with original doors, panelling, as well as door and window furniture surviving.

The nave has a timber floor, partially carpeted. The walls are plastered and painted. The ceiling is match lined in diagonal timbers. The nave is notable for its four memorial windows to significant parishioners. The original pews, altar furniture, pulpit and organ remain in place. To the rear of the nave is a functional kitchen and office space. The organ is built into the end wall of the church. The windows are a significant interior feature, with aesthetic and historical value, linking this church with its predecessor and to important families in the congregation.

At basement level, there are two large spaces providing a generous meeting hall (currently used for storage for the kindergarten), and a sports room used for indoor basketball. The meeting space has built in cupboards and is match lined.

ASSESSMENT OF HERITAGE SIGNIFICANCE

HISTORIC/SOCIAL

The building demonstrates heritage values within this criterion. Heritage New Zealand Pouhere Taonga's assessment of historic significance is reproduced below:

'Andersons Bay parish was the first developed outside First Church and is therefore one of the significant early parishes in the history of the Presbyterian Church in Dunedin's Free Church settlement. Associated with the church are individuals and families of note, including the Hon. Mathew Holmes and the Somerville family who played key roles in the city and the suburb. The 1914 church was built to commemorate the jubilee of the first church and represents the parish at its heyday. Its subsequent history represents the important role that the parish played in community outreach, and still later, the decline of organised religion in twenty and twenty-first century Otago, and more generally in New Zealand.'

SPIRITUAL/CULTURAL

The building demonstrates heritage values within this criterion. Heritage New Zealand Pouhere Taonga's assessment of spiritual significance is reproduced below:

'The Andersons Bay Presbyterian Church has spiritual significance as the place of worship for the Andersons Bay parish for over 100 years. Despite the closure of the church, the sense of spiritual intention and worship remains evident in the architecture and the memorial windows.'

DESIGN

The building demonstrates heritage values within this criterion. Heritage New Zealand Pouhere Taonga's aesthetic and architectural significance assessments are reproduced below:

'The Andersons Bay Church has architectural significance as a suburban church dating from the early years of the twentieth century. It is the work of Dunedin architect Edward Walden, known for his commercial and residential work, including the former King Edward Picture Theatre. Walden's Gothic design in brick represents the solidity and permanence of the community and their religious ideals. The stained-glass windows add significant value to the building.'

'The Andersons Bay Presbyterian Church has aesthetic significance its prominent location at the intersection of several streets, overlooking Andersons Bay and the distant city makes it a local landmark and key building in this suburb. The brick building, stained glass window, timber interior detailing and chattels give the church strong visual appeal.'

TECHNOLOGICAL/SCIENTIFIC

The building does not demonstrate heritage values within this criterion.

REFERENCES

Refer to Heritage New Zealand's List entry report saved to Pataka. Online list entry available.

Date Assessment Completed	11 April 2023 - Transcribed and reformatted from HNZPT list entry report. Minor editing for sense.	Author	HB
Date Peer Reviewed	9 August 2024	Reviewer	MM
Date Confirmed Complete	9 August 2024		

DRAFT