

**From:** Grace Ockwell  
**To:** [REDACTED]  
**Subject:** LGOIMA requests - 4 December 2014  
**Date:** Thursday, 23 April 2015 04:48:56 p.m.  
**Attachments:** [Butler, Bev LGOIMA 4 December 2014 - 4 Requests.pdf](#)  
[Butler, Bev LGOIMA 4 December 2014 Attachment Forsyth Barr Stadium Renewals Expenditure.pdf](#)

---

Dear Bev,

I refer to your 4 emails of December 2014 in which you asked a series of questions with respect to the Forsyth Barr Stadium.

Your requests have been considered under the provisions of LGOIMA and the following responses are provided. I have repeated your questions to give context to our response.

**Request 1 "Acoustics"**

Recently in the ODT (9/12/14), it was reported "Forsyth Barr Stadium officials are looking to solve the venue's sound problems after confirming ticket sales for major concerts are being restricted as a short-term fix."

Given the Carisbrook Stadium Trust was responsible for ensuring the stadium was fit for purpose, I request the name of the consultancy company commissioned to ensure the acoustics were suitable for concerts.

We do not hold this information.

**Request 2 "Stadium Review"**

Earlier in the year it was announced that the stadium was to be reviewed and that all options would be considered, including mothballing. Now with the recent release of the Stadium Review only two options are presented, namely, the status quo and the most extreme option of demolition.

1. Why were the options of sale and mothballing not reported on?

The option of mothballing was considered and discounted early on in the review process. It was not pursued further or fully costed because of the many practical issues with the option.

Notes about the mothballing option are attached for your information.

The option of sale was not considered as part of the review but is always possible should there be a willing buyer.

2. Did the Stadium Review committee look at the sale and mothballing options?  
If so, I request a copy of the findings. If not, why not?

The options were not discussed in any detail by the Committee. The mothballing option looked to be both more expensive than demolishing, but also the feedback that it would be extremely difficult to entice events to a 'mothballed' stadium. Thus the uncertainties made detailed financial modelling impossible.

The sale option was not examined in detail because internationally where sales have all been made it is at a fraction of the cost of the facility, and we have no buyer interest. If a buyer were to make an approach, this option would be examined in detail at that point.

3. Whose decision (names) was it to not include mothballing as an option?

The options were developed by staff who recommended that only the closure and demolish option were pursued.

4. Did the NZRU and/or ORFU have any input into the Review?

No.

5. Who (names) from the NZRU/ORFU was consulted/involved in the Review?

Please refer to the answer to question four.

6. Did any member of NZRU and/or ORFU influence/ pressure/request that the mothballing option be removed/excluded from the Review? If so, who (names)?

Please refer to the answer to question four.

7. Mayor Cull has publicly stated that the demolition option was included in the Review to show the "lunatic fringe" that demolition is not a realistic option.

a) Who(names) are the "lunatic fringe"?

The Mayor was referring to anyone believing a general 'conspiracy theorist' approach, no particular people were named.

b) If Mayor Cull is unable to name members of the "lunatic fringe" then why was the demolition option considered?

This is not a request for information as defined by LGOIMA.

c) Why were the mothballing options not considered when well informed stadium critics had publicly called for this option? ie. Why was the extreme option from an unidentified "lunatic fringe" considered over the mothballing option proposed by identifiable well informed stadium critics, like myself, who have been proven correct in their predictions?

These are requests for expression of opinions, rather than requests for information. Please specify what information you are requesting.

8. What part did Sir John Hansen play in stifling the mothballing option?

Sir John Hansen played no part in stifling the mothballing option.

9. Will the mothballing options now be reviewed?

The Dunedin City Council does not intend to review the mothball option.

### **Request 3 \$6.4 m capital maintenance fund**

In the Stop The Stadium Appeal Volume Three: Exhibits on page 216 under the Dunedin City Council 2008/2009 Draft Annual Plan and signed by Mr Jim Harland as an Exhibit Note and referred to in Mr Jim Harland's affidavit it states:

"The Council also proposes to borrow \$6.4 million for a 50-year capital maintenance fund making its total contribution \$91.4 million."

I request the documentation which shows how the Carisbrook Stadium Trust and/or the Dunedin City Council arrived at this \$6.4 million figure for a 50-year capital maintenance fund.

Please refer to page 7 Section 1.0 of the Executive Summary of The New Stadium Development Consulting Team's Carisbrook Opportunity, Dunedin Master Plan and Feasibility Report, 19 February 2007 which is attached.

### **Request 4 \$51.885m maintenance and renewals**

In the Stadium Review released November 2014 it records a total of \$51.885

million being required over the next 20 years for maintenance and renewals. I request a copy of how this figure was arrived at.

Please find attached a copy of the draft Forsyth Barr Stadium Renewals Expenditure spreadsheet prepared by the Forsyth Barr Facilities Manager.

Yours sincerely,

Grace Ockwell

Governance Support Officer

**Dunedin City Council**

50 The Octagon, Dunedin; PO Box 5045, Moray Place, Dunedin 9058, New Zealand

Telephone: 03 474 3487, Fax: 03 474 3594

Email: [grace.ockwell@dcc.govt.nz](mailto:grace.ockwell@dcc.govt.nz); [www.dunedin.govt.nz](http://www.dunedin.govt.nz)



Please consider the environment before printing this e-mail

## Mothballing Option - Exploration of Issues

- 1 Full-time job preparing stadium for major events
  - Event preparation
- 2 Rugby - credibility issues  
Highlanders - possibly move to Invercargill and Queenstown - major risk that we'll lose them if no stadium for training, regular season games. No tests? Unlikely in a mothballed stadium.
  - Preseason
    - 6 weeks out from a professional game
    - Health and safety issues
    - Game by game preparation
    - Training - showers
  - Season
    - Sign-off on costs
    - Scheduling
  - 2 months lead in
- 3 Members
  - Tickets
  - Carparking
  - \$3.8m annual income – members are serviced on a daily basis
  - Lose signage (sponsorship)
  - Informing members of events
  - Forsyth Barr issues
  - Likely to be no revenue from memberships
- 4 Ground staff
  - Certain surface
  - Rugby cost - involvement in a test match
  - Ongoing fortnightly meetings commencing 6 months out
  - FIFA - a year out of fortnightly meetings
- 5 MICE staff reduction 1 FTE
  - \$120k (income from MICE)
  - A set-up person 45k maybe
- 6 Promoters
  - wouldn't take the risk
  - no major events
  - who would bid for events

}

High risk that promoters wouldn't run an event (concert) at a 'mothballed' stadium. Impossible to estimate in advance - so what would we say in any cost/benefit or financial modelling.
- 7 Credibility
  - Economic drive - major events
- 8 Cost of consultants to open/shut the stadium larger than wage bill potentially
- 9 Costs even if not being used
  - Staff - Contract out for events- probably higher cost than staff cost. Still required to meet warranty costs
  - Still have to fund depreciation
  - Turf maintenance? How? Replace (see turf option)
  - Insurance etc.

- 10 Community events lost
- 11 Health and Safety issues? Need staff?
- 12 \$96k warranty costs  
All maintenance costs in asset management plan
  - 2 staff maintain and manage
  - Roof and cladding

**Selling Option**

- Too early to consider this option
- The Stadium needs a few years to run.

#### 1.2.4 What are the operating projections?

The table below indicates the average likely annual earnings before interest, tax, depreciation and amortisation, that can be expected from the proposed Awatea Street developments

The figures are an annual average result of a 15 year cycle.

Item	Option 1a - With Roof	Option 1b - Without Roof
Total Projected Revenue	\$3,530,000	\$3,095,000
Total Projected Variable Costs	(\$1,049,000)	(\$985,000)
Total Overheads	(\$2,172,000)	(\$1,944,000)

Table 3 – Option 1a and 1b Operating Projections

The positive operating surplus, which is contrary to most stadia around NZ is a reflection of the multi purpose nature of the facility and the spin off from University activity. At the level of surplus shown debt funding should be avoided.

The figures above do not include for major maintenance items. A present value estimate based on 2010 dollars, for all capital maintenance over the next fifty years is \$6,359,000 for Option 1a and \$4,711,000 for Option 1b. This cost will be reduced by accumulated operating surpluses.

\$30  
22.1  
307 surplus  
before

no interest, tax, depreciation, amortisation  
major maintenance

3,221,000

is this all?

### Long Term Capital Replacement

1	Draft Copy - Facilities Manager			M	N	O	P	Q	R	S	T	U	V	W	X	Y	Z	AA	AB	AC	AD	AE	AF
	Description	Working life	Original replacement value	2014/2015	2015/2016	2016/2017	2017/2018	2018/2019	2019/2020	2020/2021	2021/2022	2022/2023	2023/2024	2024/2025	2025/2026	2026/2027	2027/2028	2028/2029	2029/2030	2030/2031	2031/2032	2032/2033	2033/2034
2																							
3				\$237,808	\$13,365	\$437,386	\$313,288	\$288,778	\$1,034,746	\$1,380,000	\$4,444,421	\$1,833,926	\$479,992	\$271,254.00		\$4,129,520.00	\$6,756,001.00	\$430,613.00	\$1,228,365.00	\$180,000.00	\$26,469,628.00	\$1,081,535.00	\$843,838.00
4	Aluminium Joinery & Shop Fronts	20	\$1,544,806																		\$1,544,806		
5	Metal Roof and wall cladding	30	\$3,884,504																				
6	ETFE Roofing	20	\$16,039,664																		\$16,039,664		
7	Membrane roofing	25	\$386,529																				
8	Trafficable Membrane	20	\$1,693,519																		\$1,693,519		
9	Balustrades	25	\$1,320,708																				
10	Access Ladders	25	\$54,231																				
11	Stair balustrades	25	\$79,683																				
12	Queueing barrier rails	25	\$576,956																				
13	Roller Doors	13	\$244,212										\$244,212.00										
14	Toilet cubicles	16	\$350,947																				
15	Door and gate hardware	15	\$294,304									\$294,304											
16	Safety Restraint system	13	\$155,937										\$155,937										
17	Stadium seating Fixed	16	\$1,719,260														\$1,719,260.00						
18	Stadium Seating removable	16	\$214,609														\$214,609						
19	Fixtures and fittings	25	\$487,191																				
20	Flush valves	10	\$289,553								\$289,553										\$289,553.00		
21	Pumps for water supplies	10	\$47,602								\$47,602.00										\$47,602.00		
22	Lift sump pump	16	\$4,506														\$4,506.00						
23	UPG reticulation, gas boilers	15	\$231,667								\$231,667												
24	Tempering valves	16	\$54,680														\$54,680.00						
25	Isolation valves/ flow regulators	25	\$165,290																				
26	Plant room meters, return pumps	10	\$94,720								\$94,720										\$94,720.00		
27	Urinal and WC flush valves	10	\$657,128									\$657,128										\$657,128.00	
28	Air Handling Units	20	\$537,997																		\$537,997		
29	Split system heat pumps	12	\$20,000									\$20,000											\$20,000.00
30	VRV System	15	\$39,248													\$39,248.00							
31	Fans	15	\$211,975													\$211,975							
32	Electrical panels and wiring	25	\$633,820																				\$633,820
33	BMS Controls	10	\$211,610								\$211,610										\$211,610.00		
34	Diesel booster pump	25	\$54,194																				
35	Sprinkler system	25	\$1,173,858																				
36	Fire Hose reels	25	\$48,178																				
37	Fire Extinguishers	15	\$2,105													\$2,105.00							
38	Alarm and evac system	20	\$627,264																		\$627,264		
39	Lifts	25	\$627,840																				
40	Generator and liquid fuel system	25	\$134,167																				
41	UPS	6	\$127,480				\$127,480					\$127,480						\$127,480.00					
42	Lighting system	10	\$960,710								\$960,710										\$960,710.00		
43	Lighting control system	12	\$131,409									\$131,409											
44	Sports lighting system	10	\$894,915								\$894,915										\$894,915.00		
45	Emergency lighting system	10	\$142,445								\$142,445										\$142,445.00		
46	Landscape and carpark lighting system	10	\$550,247								\$550,247										\$550,247.00		
47	PA system	8	\$961,381								\$961,381						\$961,381						
48	Data/Comms/MATV systems	15	\$555,971													\$555,971.00							
49	Security/CCTV systems	10	\$629,575								\$629,575										\$629,575.00		
50	HV Transformers	40	\$873,124																				
51	Suspended ceilings	20	\$474,422																		\$474,422		
52	Sheet rubber flooring	10	\$28,419								\$28,419										\$28,419.00		
53	Vinyl flooring	7	\$93,778					\$93,778										\$93,778.00					
54	Carpet	7	\$77,889																			\$77,889.00	
55	Carpet tiles	15	\$185,808			\$77,889	\$185,808											\$185,808.00					
56	Tactile indicator tiles	5	\$79,066								\$79,066						\$79,066.00				\$79,066.00		
57	Entry matting	5	\$7,035				\$7,035											\$7,035.00					\$7,035.00
58	Stair nosing	5	\$71,076				\$71,076					\$71,076					\$71,076.00						\$71,076
59	Floor tiling	20	\$94,499																		\$94,499		
60	Internal painting	10	\$711,835	\$150,000		\$150,000		\$150,000		\$150,000		\$150,000		\$150,000		\$150,000.00		\$150,000.00		\$150,000.00		\$150,000	
61	Hand rails, seat brackets	20	\$166,518																			\$166,518.00	
62	Tactile indicators	12	\$98,542									\$98,542											\$98,542
63	Security and General fencing	20	\$652,289																		\$652,289		
64	Wayfinding signage	20	\$300,024																		\$300,024		
65	Demountable seating	16	\$2,616,406														\$2,616,406.00						
66	Catering Kitchen Equipment	15	\$2,861,155														\$2,861,155.00						
67	Catering Mech Equip	16	\$928,275														\$928,275.00				\$57,808		
68	Replay screens	5	\$788,000							\$1,200,000								\$1,200,000.00					
69	UPS	7	\$15,000					\$15,000										\$15,000.00					
70	Artificial Turf System	10	\$491,970								\$491,970												
71	Hand rails, seat brackets	20	\$166,518																				
72	Soft landscaping (planting)	15	\$278,373																				
73	Road marking	5	\$57,808	\$57,808					\$60,000				\$7,808										
74	Millium - Electrical Security and General	25	\$490,579																				
75	Fencing	20	\$652,289																				
76	Roof Irrigation System	15	\$200,000													\$200,000							
77	Rinnai Water Heaters/pump	10	\$18,867								\$18,867												
78	Permanent Relocatable Toilets	20	\$480,620																		\$480,620		
79	Total Furniture Value			\$30,000		\$30,000		\$30,000		\$30,000		\$30,000		\$30,000		\$30,000		\$30,000		\$30,000		\$30,000	
80	Chairs - changing	12.5	\$4,112																				
81	Chairs - staff	12.5	\$2,920																				
82	Chairs - lounges	12.5	\$49,063																				
83	Bar leaner	12.5	\$48,774																				
84	Bar stools	12.5	\$59,428																				
85	Rectangular table 1800 x 750	15.5	\$13,725																				
86	Rectangular table 2400 x 750	15.5	\$16,714																				
87	Rectangular table 1800 x 450	15.5	\$29,198																				
88	Rectangular table 2400 x 450	15.5	\$17,546																				
89	Rectangular serving table 1000 x 750	15.5	\$2,229																				
90	Round table - lounge - 1500	15.5	\$15,320																				
91	Round table - lounge - 1800	15.5	\$2,718																				
92	Round table - meeting	15.5	\$1,247																				