

From: Grace Ockwell
To: [REDACTED]
Cc: [Kristy Rusher](#); [Sandy Graham](#)
Subject: RE: FW: LGOIMA Information Request - South Dunedin Flood
Date: Tuesday, 3 November 2015 03:59:14 p.m.
Attachments: [Kerr, Elizabeth LGOIMA Flood Debrief Notes 2015.pdf](#)
[Kerr, Elizabeth LGOIMA Correspondence Hendry and Williams 2015.pdf](#)
[image001.png](#)
[image002.png](#)
[image003.jpg](#)
[image004.jpg](#)
[image005.jpg](#)

Dear Elizabeth,

Thank you for your email of 30 September 2015 requesting " in electronic format, (a) copy of all communications received from Bruce Hendry and Trevor Williams in the period 1 May 2015 to 31 July 2015."

Thank you also for your follow up emails of last week and today.

Your request has been considered under the provisions of Local Government Official Information and Meetings Act 1987 (LGOIMA) and the correspondence requested is attached.

The names of some Dunedin City Council staff and the name/s of persons referred to in Mr Hendry's correspondence have been withheld pursuant to section 7(2)(a) of LGOIMA in order to protect their privacy.

You also requested information regarding any debriefing notes for the June flood. They were previously withheld. The Council has reviewed its decision and is now in a position to provide the information requested with redactions made on the grounds that it maintains the effective conduct of public affairs through free and frank expression of opinions by, between or to members of a local authority or officers or employees in the course of their duty (section 7(2)(f)(i) and (ii) of the LGOIMA)

As you are aware, as some information has been withheld, you have the right pursuant to section 27 of LGOIMA to have our decision reviewed by the Office of the Ombudsman who may be contacted at:

The Ombudsman
Office of the Ombudsman
PO Box 10 152
WELLINGTON 6143

Ph 0800 802 602

www.ombudsman.parliament.nz

info@ombudsman.parliament.nz

Kind regards,

Grace Ockwell
Governance Support Officer
Civic and Legal

Dunedin City Council
50 The Octagon, Dunedin; P O Box 5045, Moray Place, Dunedin 9058, New Zealand
Telephone: 03 477 4000
Email: grace.ockwell@dcc.govt.nz



 Please consider the environment before printing this e-mail

From: Elizabeth Kerr [REDACTED]
Sent: Monday, 2 November 2015 9:29 p.m.
To: Grace Ockwell; DCC LGOIMA Information Request
Cc: Elizabeth Kerr; Sue Bidrose; Sandy Graham; Kristy Rusher; Laura McElhone; editor@odt.co.nz
Subject: RE: FW: LGOIMA Information Request - South Dunedin Flood

Dear Grace

Reference No: **520749**

No response was received today (Monday) from Dunedin City Council as indicated would happen in your email of 30

October 2015.

If no response is received by 5pm tomorrow (Tuesday) 3 November 2015, the matter will be referred as a formal complaint to the Ombudsman.

Kind regards, Elizabeth

--

Elizabeth Kerr
[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Sent from [Mail](#) for Windows 10

From: Grace Ockwell
Sent: Friday, 30 October 2015 4:58 p.m.
To: Elizabeth Kerr
Subject: RE: FW: LGOIMA Information Request - South Dunedin Flood

Hi Elizabeth,

In haste. A full response will be provided on Monday.

Kind regards

Grace

From: Elizabeth Kerr [REDACTED]
Sent: Friday, 30 October 2015 2:49 p.m.
To: Grace Ockwell; DCC LGOIMA Information Request
Cc: Elizabeth Kerr; Sue Bidrose; Sandy Graham; Kristy Rusher; Laura McElhone; editor@odt.co.nz
Subject: Re: FW: LGOIMA Information Request - South Dunedin Flood

Dear Grace

Please acknowledge receipt of my email below (28.10.15) and advise progress. Thank you.

Kind regards

Elizabeth Kerr
[REDACTED]

Sent from my smartphone network

----- Original message -----

From: Elizabeth Kerr [REDACTED]
Date: 28/10/2015 12:10 pm (GMT+12:00)
To: Grace Ockwell <Grace.Ockwell@dcc.govt.nz>, DCC LGOIMA Information Request <officialinformation@dcc.govt.nz>
Cc: Sue Bidrose <Sue.Bidrose@dcc.govt.nz>, Sandy Graham <Sandy.Graham@dcc.govt.nz>, Kristy Rusher <Kristy.Rusher@dcc.govt.nz>, "Laura McElhone" <laura.mcelhone@dcc.govt.nz> <laura.mcelhone@dcc.govt.nz>,<

editor@odt.co.nz, Elizabeth Kerr [REDACTED]
Subject: FW: LGOIMA Information Request - South Dunedin Flood

Dear Grace

Reference No: 520749

Please could you indicate if the further information requested below can be provided within 20 working days (today) if taken from the date of the request made on 30/9/15, see below (noting name correction delivered next day, 1/10/15).

This official information request is not dependent on the issue of a 'council report' at an indeterminate November 2015 meeting of a council standing committee or that of the full council. As in indeed stands and applies to your official response of 25/9/15 when you said: Please note that the questions raised by the former DCC staff member are comprehensively addressed in a report scheduled to be presented in public at the next meeting of either the Infrastructure Service Committee on 13 October 2015 or the next meeting of Council on 27 October 2015.

I look forward to detailed response.

Kind regards, Elizabeth

--

Elizabeth Kerr
[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Sent from [Mail](#) for Windows 10

From: Elizabeth Kerr
Sent: Thursday, 1 October 2015 10:36 a.m.
To: Grace Ockwell; DCC LGOIMA Information Request
Cc: Elizabeth Kerr; Sue Bidrose; Sandy Graham; Kristy Rusher; Laura McElhone; editor@odt.co.nz
Subject: Re: LGOIMA Information Request - South Dunedin Flood
Dear Grace (and All)
The below should read Bruce **Hendry** (not Henry).
Apologies, the error due to predictive text and my inattention.
Regards
Elizabeth Kerr
Sent from my smartphone network

----- Original message -----

From: Elizabeth Kerr [REDACTED]
Date: 30/09/2015 11:01 PM (GMT+12:00)
To: Grace Ockwell, DCC LGOIMA Information Request
Cc: Sue Bidrose, Sandy Graham, Kristy Rusher, Laura McElhone, editor@odt.co.nz, Elizabeth Kerr
Subject: LGOIMA Information Request - South Dunedin Flood

Dear Grace

Reference No: **520749** [Confirmation of receipt of LGOIMA request]

Would Dunedin City Council please provide, in electronic format, copy of all communications received from Bruce Henry and Trevor Williams in the period 1 May 2015 to 31 July 2015.

I look forward to your prompt reply.

Kind regards

Elizabeth Kerr

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

From: Elizabeth Kerr
Sent: Monday, 28 September 2015 8:15 p.m.
To: Grace Ockwell
Cc: Elizabeth Kerr
Subject: Re: FW: LGOIMA Information Request

Dear Grace

Thanks very much for this information and its set out.

The identity of the requestor was privately revealed to me a while back - question 4 has been answered, somewhat rhetorically given time elapsed.

I look forward to reading the pending report as well as attending the ISC or Council meeting for further clarification on infrastructural cause/contributing factors to the South Dunedin flood.

Kind regards, Elizabeth

[REDACTED]

Sent from my smartphone network

----- Original message -----

From: Grace Ockwell <Grace.Ockwell@dcc.govt.nz>
Date: 25/09/2015 2:52 PM (GMT+12:00)
To: [REDACTED]
Cc: Kristy Rusher <Kristy.Rusher@dcc.govt.nz>, Sandy Graham <Sandy.Graham@dcc.govt.nz>, Laura McElhone <Laura.McElhone@dcc.govt.nz>
Subject: FW: LGOIMA Information Request

Dear Elizabeth,

I refer to your email of 3 September 2015 requesting various information about the South Dunedin stormwater pumping stations.

Your request has been considered under the provisions of LGOIMA and the following response is provided.

I have repeated your questions to give context to our response.

Question 1.

I would like to request the asset register entries (or database or other list) for all DCC-owned stormwater pumping stations that serve South Dunedin and which due to their physical location will have functioned or not during the flood in early June 2015.

DCC Response

There are two stormwater pumping stations serving the South Dunedin catchment. The Portobello pumping station and the smaller Tainui pumping station which is co-located with the Musselburgh wastewater pumping station. The "Musselburgh pumping station" refers to the wastewater pumping station that pumps to the Tahuna wastewater treatment plant.

Question 2.

A former DCC staff member was advised recently that one major reason for the flooding was that at least one of the Musselburgh pumping station pumps was not working. When questioned by this person Laura McElhone, group manager water and waste, denied there was even a stormwater pumping station at Musselburgh, then had to agree that there was.

Why did Laura McElhone (group manager) not know that there was a stormwater pumping station at Musselburgh, given the length of time she had been employed by DCC (since April 2008)?

DCC Response:

In responding to this request the Group Manager Water and Waste, Dr Laura McElhone assumes that you are referring to a conversation that she had with a former Dunedin City Council staff member on 4 June 2015. During that conversation the former DCC staff member seemed to be suggesting that foul sewage was pumped from the Musselburgh pumping station to Portobello and Dr McElhone assured him that this was not the case. During a later conversation with the former DCC staff member it became apparent that Dr McElhone and he had been talking at cross purposes; they then confirmed that they both had the same understanding of the configuration of the network. (i.e. the Tainui stormwater pumping station pumps stormwater to Portobello).

Question 3

Is it correct that the former DCC staff member, now member of the public, has recently made five requests to DCC seeking the pump logs for Musselburgh stormwater pumping station, to confirm if the pumps were working or not – presumably before, during and after the flood at South Dunedin in early June 2015? And that DCC refused to release the logs?

DCC Response

No. It is not correct that five requests were made to the DCC for this information.

Question 4

Who made the five requests mentioned at 3.? And were these treated as LGOIMA requests?

Question 5.

On what grounds is DCC refusing to release the pump logs?

DCC Responses to Questions 4 and 5:

The name of the requestor is withheld pursuant to section 7(2)(a) of LGOIMA in order to protect their privacy.

The request for information was processed by Water and Waste Services staff. The information requested was not provided as the data had not been verified.

Please note that the questions raised by the former DCC staff member are comprehensively addressed in a report scheduled to be presented in public at the next meeting of either the Infrastructure Service Committee on 13 October 2015 or the next meeting of Council on 27 October 2015.

With regard to the comment on the public availability of infrastructure information, the Council's Integrated Management Plans are the best source of this information and are available on our website and provide detailed information on the Council's stormwater infrastructure.

You can view these plans here: [Catchment management - Dunedin City Council](#)

Yours sincerely,

Grace Ockwell

Governance Support Officer

Civic and Legal

Dunedin City Council

50 The Octagon, Dunedin; P O Box 5045, Moray Place, Dunedin 9058, New Zealand

Telephone: 03 477 4000

Email: grace.ockwell@dcc.govt.nz

Please consider the environment before printing this e-mail

From: Elizabeth Kerr [REDACTED]
Sent: Thursday, 3 September 2015 10:55 p.m.
To: Sandy Graham
Cc: Elizabeth Kerr; Grace Ockwell; Laura McElhone; editor@odt.co.nz
Subject: LGOIMA Information Request
Dear Sandy

Noting last year's DCC media release [my highlighting]:

City Care Contract Starts Today (28.2.14)

DCC staff will still be responsible for looking after treatment plants, pumping stations and water reservoirs.

The contract with City Care is expected to deliver annual savings of at least \$350,000. As well as cost savings, the contract will deliver other considerable benefits. These include more assessment of sewer pipe condition through the dedicated use of specialist equipment, which will enable better renewal planning. **It will also allow more wastewater and stormwater sewers to be cleaned regularly, which will reduce the risk of flooding, as well as reducing the amount of sediment reaching the Otago Harbour.**

<http://www.dunedin.govt.nz/your-council/latest-news/february-2014/city-care-contract-starts-today>

And noting this information at the DCC website:

Andersons Bay Water Main Renewal

<http://www.dunedin.govt.nz/your-council/council-projects/andersons-bay-water-main-renewal>

We are about to begin the second stage of water, wastewater and stormwater pipeline renewal work in the Andersons Bay and Musselburgh areas.

June 2015 Update:.....

<http://www.dunedin.govt.nz/your-council/council-projects/andersons-bay-water-main-renewal/project-timelines>

<http://www.dunedin.govt.nz/your-council/council-projects/andersons-bay-water-main-renewal/background-and-the-new-pipes>

My requests for information are:

1.

I would like to request the asset register entries (or database or other list) for all DCC-owned stormwater pumping stations that serve South Dunedin and which due to their physical location will have functioned or not during the flood in early June 2015.

2.

A former DCC staff member was advised recently that one major reason for the flooding was that at least one of the Musselburgh pumping station pumps was not working. When questioned by this person Laura McElhone, group manager water and waste, denied there was even a stormwater pumping station at Musselburgh, then had to agree that there was.

Why did Laura McElhone (group manager) not know that there was a stormwater pumping station at Musselburgh, given the length of time she had been employed by DCC (since April 2008)?

3.

Is it correct that the former DCC staff member, now member of the public, has recently made five requests to DCC seeking the pump logs for Musselburgh stormwater pumping station, to confirm if the pumps were working or not – presumably before, during and after the flood at South Dunedin in early June 2015? And that DCC refused to release the logs?

4.

Who made the five requests mentioned at 3.? And were these treated as LGOIMA requests?

5.

On what grounds is DCC refusing to release the pump logs?

Lastly, an observation.

I note the DCC Draft Infrastructure Strategy (released for consultation 24 March 2015) does not include a list of stormwater pumping stations (amongst other infrastructure assets not accounted for in the document).

I have no wish to start a policy/strategy 'content' debate here but an asset register (existing '3 waters' assets, where known) should be available online for public scrutiny alongside or as part of (appendices) the Infrastructure Strategy. The Draft Strategy appears to be deficient in many respects although, of course, this is not the place to argue it.

http://www.dunedin.govt.nz/__data/assets/pdf_file/0004/488245/Infrastructure-Strategy.pdf

I look forward to reply.

Kind regards, Elizabeth

--

Elizabeth Kerr

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

If this message is not intended for you please delete it and notify us immediately; you are warned that any further use, dissemination, distribution or reproduction of this material by you is prohibited.

If this message is not intended for you please delete it and notify us immediately; you are warned that any further use, dissemination, distribution or reproduction of this material by you is prohibited.